PATRIARCHAL BARRIERS TO WOMEN'S POLITICAL PARTICIPATION IN SOUTH-EAST ASIA:

Lessons from the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste on Patriarchy and the Rise of Women's Participation in State Politics

PATRIARCHAL BARRIERS TO WOMEN'S POLITICAL PARTICIPATION IN SOUTH-EAST ASIA:

Lessons from the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste on Patriarchy and the Rise of Women's Participation in State Politics

kemitraan
partnership

Patriarchal Barriers to Women's Political Participation in South-East Asia:
Lessons from the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste on Patriarchy and the Rise of Women's Participation in State Politics

Lead Researchers:
Adriana Venny
Ruth Indiah Rahayu

Local Researchers:
Renato A. Llorin (Filipina)
Sabrina Laya Sichongco (Filipina)
Nizam Nazreen (Malaysia)
Lau Shu Shi (Malaysia)
Antonieta Tomas da Graca Maia (Timor-Leste)
Maria da Costa Exposto (Timor-Leste)
Chor Chanthyda (Kamboja)
Sri Zul Chairiyah (Indonesia)

Tim Editor:
Dewi Watson
Hery Sulistio
Inda Loekman
Merita Gidarjati
Mutiara Pasaribu
Nindita Paramastuti

Layout:
ASTANA communication

◤ Contents

Foreword

"When women are empowered, all of society benefits"

(UN Deputy Secretary General Asha Rose Migiro)

Kemitraan believes that the more women are elected to public offices, the more beneficial those policies are to the public. Kemitraan has been assisting women political activists in their efforts to increase women political participation and representation in parliament as well as the broader public decision-making processes. Aside from helping the potential women candidates in acquiring skills in competing with their male counterparts, we are also providing the elected members with the necessary knowledge to enable them to perform better in their position in parliament. In supporting women movement in Indonesia in general, Kemitraan has been conducting variety of research ranging from the issue of environment, corruption to gender issues. Some of the research was the regional research conducted under the USAID funded programme of IKAT-US Component 1.

Under the IKAT-US Component 1, Kemitraan formed a partnership with the National Democratic Institute (NDI), the Indonesian Women's Coalition (KPI), Persatuan Kesedaran Komuniti Selangor (EMPOWER) from Malaysia, the Women's Caucus from Timor-Leste, the Cambodian Center for Human Rights (CCHR), and the Center for Popular Empowerment (CPE) from the Philippines. The partnership works together on the issue of promoting and to ensuring equitable women's political representation in Southeast Asian.

Regional research conducted under this programme became the source for the development of this publication. This publication focuses on Patriarchal Barriers to Women's Political Participationin South-East Asia: Lessons from the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste on Patriarchy and the Rise of Women's Participation in State Politics. The research has been done by prominent thought researchers and also practitioners on the related issues with invaluable contributions from the five countries regional partners of IKAT-US Component 1.

Kemitraan hopes that this material will enrich the discussion and understanding on the issue of women's political participation and representation. Kemitraan also hopes that this publication will serve as resource for Kemitraan's work in Indonesia or the five countries above. Last but not least, this publication will also serve as reference for the political party and civil society leaders who have been working on increasing women's political participation and representation, either for further research or advocacy.

Kemitraan would like to thank the USAID for supporting this initiative under the IKAT-US Component 1 programme and for their continuing supports in advancing democracy throughout Southeast Asia. Kemitraan would also like to thank the above-mentioned regional partners who have contributed to the success of the programme.

Jakarta, May 2014

Wicaksono Sarosa, Ph.D

Executive Director of Partnership

Acknowledgment

◣ About

Partnership for Governance Reform (Kemitraan)

Kemitraan is a multi-stakeholder organization established to promote governance reform. It works hand-in-hand with government agencies, civil society organizations, the private sector, and international development partners in Indonesia to bring about reform at both the national and local levels. Kemitraan brings together the executive, legislative and judicial branches of government, with civil society and other stakeholders to sustainably promote good governance in Indonesia. Because of our national ownership, Kemitraan is uniquely positioned to initiate programs that need Indonesian partners in positions of authority.

Kemitraan was first established in 2000 following the successful first free and fair election in Indonesia in 1999. The election produced a more credible government following decades of authoritarian rule by the Soeharto regime. Kemitraan was initially set up as a program funded by multi-donor and managed by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). The main motivation of the establishment of Kemitraan was to create a multi-stakeholder platform which becomes the core supporter of the Indonesian society in navigating complex, long and often difficult process of governance reform. Kemitraan became an independent legal entity in 2003 and was registered as a not-forprofit civil law association, while retaining its status as a UNDP project until December 2009. Over the last eleven years, Kemitraan has grown from a UNDP project into a trusted, independent and prominent Indonesian organization.

Kemitraan has a mission to disseminating, advancing and institutionalizing the principles of good and clean governance among government, civil society and business, while considering human rights, gender balance, the marginalized and environmental sustainability. We are effective in our mission when:

- Our stakeholders seek to continue program development with us and recommend us to others.
- Our innovation and efforts are transformed into improved governance in Indonesian government and society.
- Our influence engenders increased commitment to governance reform from governments at all levels.

Learning from the difficult process of reform in Indonesia, often resisted by vested interests, and the challenge of setting the right course of change, Kemitraan has discovered a unique approach in governance reform: building capacity from within and applying pressure from without - our multi faceted reform approach. It involves working on several fronts – initiating reform within government agencies, empowering civil society to advocate for reform, and empowering communities to push for demand-driven development plans and public services.

Throughout its 11 year existence, Kemitraan has accumulated experiences in managing USD 100 millions grants from various development partner countries including Australia, Canada, Denmark, Finland,

France, Germany, Japan, Korea, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, and the United States of America, from international organizations including the Asian Development Bank, the European Commission, the International Organization for Migration, the UNDP, and the World Bank and from the private sectors including AXIS and Siemens.

Since 2000, Kemitraan has been working in 33 provinces in Indonesia in cooperation with 19 central government agencies, 29 local government agencies, 162 civil society organizations, 11 media organizations, 33 research institutes and universities, nine independent state agencies and five private institutions. Kemitraan has also been working with international organizations such as: TIRI-Making Integrity Work, Nordic Consulting Group (NGC), UNDP, UNODC, the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank in the implementation of projects, and has been working with Chemonics, Coffey International, GRM International, RTI and ARD in program design and development.

Kemitraan's success in implementing the above is due to the trust we have earned from various stakeholders (communities, corporations, NGOs, government agencies). We have been successful in facilitating public policy reform (the formulation of new laws and regulations or the revision / amendment to the laws and regulations), bureaucratic reforms, judicial and democratization reform, anti corruption laws, national strategies and the establishment of the Commission for the Eradication of Corruption, creating the Governance Index, promoting and facilitating environmental and economic governance and ensuring that all genders are represented.

Kemitraan is governed by two bodies: The Partners and the Executive Board. The Partners (Teman Serikat) is the highest decision making body within Kemitraan. Their role is to set the overall strategic agenda of Kemitraan, to endorse the annual report and workplan, ensure that the affairs and assets of Kemitraan are properly managed, and appoint the Executive Director. The Executive Director implements Kemitraan's annual workplan and provides overall leadership to the staff. He also develops a common vision of the overall role of Kemitraan and communicates this vision to the government, non-government and international community with a view to building a constituency for governance reform.

Kemitraan :
Jl. Wolter Monginsidi No.3 Kebayoran Baru
Jakarta Selatan 12110
Phone: 62 21 727 99 566
Fax: 62 21 7205260
Website:
www.kemitraan.or.id

Abbreviations

ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
AWS	Angkatan Wanita Sedar
CCHR	Citizens Commission on Human Rights
CEAP	Catholics Educational Association of the Philippines
CEDAW	Convention of Elimination of Discrimination Against Women
CMDGs	Cambodian Millenium Development Goals
CNRP	Cambodia National Rescue Party
CNRT	National Congress for Timorese Reconstruction
CPP	Cambodian People's Party
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
DCS	Daftar Calon Sementara/ Temporary Candidate List
DPD	Dewan Perwakilan Daerah/ Regional Representative Council
DPP	Dewan Partai Pusat / Central Party Leadership
DWSA	Dutch Women's Suffrage Association
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
Fretilin	The Frente Revolucionaria de Timor-Leste Independente
FUNCINPEC	Front Uni National pour un Cambodge Indépendant, Neutre, Pacifique, et Coopératif/ National United Front for an Independent, Neutral, Peaceful, and Cooperative Cambodia
GADC	Gender and Development in Cambodia
GMMP	Gender Media Monitoring Project
HAM	Hak Asasi Manusia/ Human Rights
LfDP	Lead for Democracy Party
MNP	Malay National Party
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MP	Member of Parliament
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PAS	Partai Islam se-Malaysia/ Pan-Malaysian Islamic Party
PBB	Perserikatan Bangsa-Bangsa

PDIP	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan/ Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle
PPP	Partai Persatuan Pembangunan/ United Development Party
PWDC	Penang Women's Development Cooperation
RGC	Royal Goverment of Cambodia
RUU	Rancangan Undang-Undang
SEPI	Secretary of State for Promotion of Equality
Susduk	Susunan dan Kedudukan
UMNO	United Malays National Organization
UN	United Nations
UN Women	United Nations Women
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNTAET	United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor
UU	Undang-Undang
UUD	Undang Undang Dasar
Wasekjen	Wakil Sekretaris Jenderal
WCI	Women's Candidacy Initiative

Chapter 1

Introduction

The results of research carried out by the Partnership and its regional partners on Women's Political Representation in the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor Leste, identified patriarchal constraints on women's participation in politics. Women's political participation is inhibited by factors including the family, the community, political parties, Parliament, Government, and the electoral process[1]. The struggle by women to participate in politics began in the 18th century in Europe and America, and in the 20th century in Asia, Latin America, and Africa. According to figures[2] in 2008, globally women only have 17.7% representation. From this we can deduce that over two centuries of women's struggles, from fighting for women's suffrage to reducing gender disparity in politics, progress has been very slow and in some countries, has even regressed. Meanwhile today, the necessity for women's equal participation in the political arena has become an urgent concern when creating state policies and governance based on gender fairness. Therefore, increasing women's participation through affirmative action quota systems is an agenda of great importance that needs to be applied globally.

The quota system is a step up from the Women's Suffrage movement, especially since the stipulation of 30% women's representation in parliaments. At the 4th Women's Conference in Beijing in 1995, South-East Asian countries accepted a mandate to implement a quota system in a move to create goverments based on gender fairness. Nevertheless, after two decades, the quota system has not yet resulted in the minimum 30% representation in South-East Asian governments. Research by Partnership shows that, currently, only Timor-Leste has been able to, not only able to meet the minimum target, but to exceed it. The rates of representation in the Philippines, Malaysia, Cambodia, and Indonesia are, on the other hand, still well below 20%. The varied figures of women's representation in these five South-East Asian countries has led to recommendations for a further study on the cultural hindrances in political participation faced by women.

This research is founded upon the above recommendation. The challenges are quite substantial. The patriarchal system itself is not immediately visible in a state's political system, as it is linked to a world of view passed on from generation to generation, and does not always stem from one single origin. Furthermore, the world of view of one country alone would present us with intricate diversities, however this report covers five countries, each rich with their own traditions and historical backgrounds. Nonetheless, the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste are states which founded their world of views based on a compromise of the dominant traditions and beliefs of their peoples. In respect to this research, the world of view in each country is taken as the foundation or basis in order to understand how the patriarchal culture is reproduced, operated, and inherited through cultural and state institutions.

---

1   *Bulding Sustainable Patnerships to Promote Women's Political Representation in the Southeast Asian Region*, a baseline assesment report by IKAT US Component 1- Power, (Jakarta: Kemitraan, 2012)

2   Genevieve Pascaud-Becane, *Participation of Women in Political Life*, (Geneve: Seri Report and Documents N 35, Inter-Parliamentary, 1999)

This research will focus on exploring world views where patriarchal systems are reproduced and socialized, in particular to women and girls. It is equally important to examine how women overcome the constraints of these patriarchal systems, especially in the political arena. A historical approach is required to provide a background on how patriarchal systems have been founded, replicated and passed on, as well as how women have struggled to surmount the obstacles over time. The five countries in this study serve as the locus where women are the focus of the research. We identify the state as an institution where the sustaining of patriarchal views and tradtitions occurs systematically, including the creating of the dominant world view. We also regard 'women' it its plural form in a national context, even though we include the singular form in examples.

With these limitations, this research has yielded descriptions regarding; *First*, patriarchy and its latent force in state institutions, of which social institutions are a part of; *Second*, similar origins of the subordination of women as a result of patriarchal systems in the five countries, observed during the colonial era, although each context is distinct due to the influence of the dominant religion, which also created the dominant culture; *Third*, women have been fighting for political participation since the struggle for independence in their country. Their attempts have experienced trials and tribulations since becoming independent states and in the 1990s women in South-East Asia, almost in unison, revived their endeavor against state patriarchy.

After developing the description of patriarchy, the essential aim of this research is to gain lessons learned from women. The key focus of this research is the strategies employed by women, both latent or manifested, when facing the state's patriarchal system. Women's power is distinct, it is able to balance the feminine and the masculine, and is manifested in the role of motherhood. This statement may be an entry point for discourse, however we will begin by looking at the experiences of women who are trying to advance in the political sphere. In its conlusion, the recommendations of this research will endeavor to answer the question how women can make policital advancements in the context of a patriarchal system.

Chapter II

The Concept of Patriarchy and Women's Power

In 2005 Farzana Bari[3] presented a report concerning women's exclusion from the formal political arena, which she explained as being part of a historical tradition, and therefore not an entirely new situation. In the report, it is stated that women's exclusion is the result of patriarchal ideology that determines the relationship model of women and politics. The patriarchal ideology operates at the economy and socio-cultural structure levels and creates disparities of social capital and political capacities between women and men.

Looking at its lexical meaning, patriarchy as conveyed by Kamla Bhasin[4] refers to rules controlled by the 'male figure' or patriarch. The word 'patriarch' was initially used to describe characters in a male-dominated family where women, children, slaves, and domestic helpers were under the domination of the male figure. Today, the term 'patriarch' is widely used to describe male domination and a power relationship between the dominating male and the subordinate female.

In modern every day life, patriarchy can be recognized by acts of discrimination that cause various forms of disparities such as in education, inheritance, work opportunities and strategic career paths, salaries and wages, and so forth. In other circumstances, the presence of patriarchy is more pronounced such as sexual and physical violence against women, including pornography, sexism in language and the visual arts and so on. Meanwhile, political manifestation of patriarchy is men's control exerted over women' bodies and sexuality, control over women's political aspirations, and control of women's 'free' choices in their lives.

Taking into account the various manifestations of patriarchy above, it is clear that patriarchy has undergone several extensions to its meaning; it has expanded from its lexical meaning of 'male figure' into a system. Sylvia Walby[5] affirmed that patriarchy, through a long historical process, has become a system that has local or regional variations. Walby defines patriarchy as "systems and practices that shape the social structure where men oppress and exploit women." It is important to underline the concept of patriarchy as a system that is not based on biological definitions. However, it can not be said arbitrarily that the formation of the patriarchal social structure is a historical inevitability

In a society-constructed system, patriarchy is dispersed and shaped differently by different historical eras, social systems, classes, and races, yet maintains a universal principle of operation. That thread emphasized by Kamla Bhasin, is the male control over females in all aspects of economy-politics and social-culture through religious institutions, households or families, judicial systems, political systems and institutions, the media, and education systems.

---

3   Farzana Bari, *Women's Political Participation: Issues and Challenges*, paper (Bangkok: *Division for the Advancement of Women*-UN, 2005)
4   Kamla Bhasin, *What is Patriarchy*, (New Delhi: Kali for Women, 1993), 3
5   Sylvia Walby, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, (Cambridge: Basil Blackwell, 1990), 92

Walby[6] presents a more detailed theory by separating patriarchy in the private and public domains. The distinction is made within the following context: first, the relationships in private and public structures and, second, relationships in institutions in the respective private-public structures. Walby's contrast is based on her analysis of the patriarchal strategy that excludes women in the private domain and segregates women in the public domain. In the private sphere, the area of patriarchy is the household, where the patriarch exerts direct control over women both in the reproductive process (biological and social) and the household's domestic environment. Meanwhile, in the public arena, patriarchy finds its footing in structures other than the household without abandoning the patriarch's control as practiced in the household.

In this respect, the myriad of institutions other than the household, is the extension of the patriarchal structure in the household. Patriarchy in the private domain is represented by men as fathers or husbands, who, by subordinating women, gain economic-political and social-cultural benefits. This does not imply that the household is the sole patriarchal structure without the support of other patriarchal structures that exclude women from the public domain. The exclusion of women in other areas would not be sustained without the patriarchal structure in the household. Public patriarchy opens access for women to enter the private and public domains. The patriarch in the public sphere does not prohibit women from entering, although he maintains the subordination therein. Respect or control over women's resources is done collectively instead of individually by the patriarchs. The household is the site of patriarchal oppression but the control is not as durable as patriarchal power in the public domain. In the public arena, the subordination of women occurs at any place or at any level, albeit it does not formally exclude women[7].

In modern or contemporary society, the entry of women into the public domain is embedded within the subordinating structure. At the workplace, aside from the separation of work type, women also receive different salaries to men, and do not have equal career opportunities. Even in today's modern society, a woman's marital status often sparks normative and morality debates regarding employment. In terms of salary, married women, who bear the double burden of working outside and inside the house, are still regarded as single persons. Moreover, there are numerous companies that limit the access of employment for married women. On the other hand, a single woman may experience stricter controls over her sexuality, even though violence towards women in both the public and private domain is uncontrollable. Ultimately, as citizens, men and women are entitled to the same rights, including the right to be elected as people's representatives in parliament even though the number of elected women is still significantly low. Cultural institutions at present seem to promote efforts to increase women's participation, however they still appear to regard women's positions as inferior.[8]

In other words, women have entered the public domain but under unfair circumstances. Women are contributing in the workplace, and in state and cultural institutions, but remain inferior. Women are specifically subordinate in terms of domestic work distribution, sexual practices, and as being the target of men's violence. The patriarchal practices in the private and public domains are connected by a continuous line; they are not separate and the relationship is reciprocal.

---

6   Walby, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, ibid, 173
7   Walby, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, Ibid, 173
8   Walby, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, Ibid 178

The second aspect of private and public patriarchy is the institutions in the respective domains. This shows women's transformation from being individuals to being part of a collective, from participating in private to public spheres, from exclusion to segregation. Walby classifies patriarchal structures or areas where women are subordinate into six institutions or categories: the state, the household, paid employment, tradition, sexuality, and violence. In terms of paid employment, women are mobilized from their exclusion in the household, working without wages, to a paid employment mechanism that segregates. In the household domain, women undergo lifelong restrictions and still today are reduced simply to their reproductive function. Cultural institutions in the meantime attempt to end women's exclusion, yet allow women's subordination to linger. In terms of sexuality, control over women shifts from control exerted specifically by husbands or fathers, to control by the public. In state institutions, from being excluded from state affairs women are now allowed to enter although in subordinate positions.[9]

The study to reveal patriarchal constraints for women's political participation focuses on the public domain of state institutions, especially political institutions and social institutions. The rationale of this focus is firstly, its relevance with other research subjects related to state political institutions, in particular formal political institutions, more specifically, formal political institutions related to the electoral system as a means to recruit political representatives in parliament. Secondly, this study will seek to identify the social relationship between the constraints of women's political participation and patriarchal cultures rooted in social institutions. Thirdly, this study will present women politicians who are driven to enter state institutions and confront the public patriarchy within them. The experiences of women in this regard are highly valuable to identify the strategies used to overcome patriarchal challenges within state organisations.

The state and social institutions are entwined in reproducing patriarchal structures that place women in subordinate positions. Social institutions that comprise religious institutions, educational establishments, and the media according to Walby and Kamla Bhasin are pillars of patriarchal reproduction in which men are groomed to be the patriarchs and women the subordinates. Social institutions are the platforms for the socialization of masculine and feminine gender representation as personal identities of male and female. From childhood, gender socialization is instilled and later it cultivates gender-based behavior. Masculinity and femininity are segregated as gender norms, disseminated through religious and educational teachings as well as the media in the public sphere. By regularly generating these messages people's patriarchal views is formed and political institutions are developed which incooperate these perceptions.

Inter-parliament research[10] identifies gender stereotyping that actively persists within state policies and political institutions. 'Politics' still bears the negative stigma of being unsuitable for women, a notion that is maintained by educational, religious, and media institutions. As a result, even though the country's political system has opened its doors to women, enabling women to participate in elections for parliamentary representatives, women are still assigned to subordinate positions determined by the state's patriarchy. Despite the 30% quota to ensure women's representation in political institutions, patriarchal tradition does not immediately accept it as state policy. Women are still required to fight to overcome patriarchal obstacles in order to achieve the 30% quota

---

9   Walby, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, Ibid, 183
10   Pascaud-Becane, *Participation of Women, op.cit*

To illustrate women's strategies to overcome patriarchal state constraints, John Gaventa[11] formulates a cube-shaped power analysis model. Power analysis is used to assess the relationship between spaces of change in a country's political system using women's capacity to provide their power (forms and visibility of power). Description on spaces of change provide information regarding the status of women's political participation: closed, semi-open (invited), or provided by the state (created). The information also includes of level of participation: local, national, or international. Conversely, women are not passively waiting for the state to create spaces of participation for them, but are proactively pursuing the access and ways to fill the space. In this regard, women exercise their power, collective or individual, to surmount patriarchal constraints. Their success may derive from visible power, invisible power, or hidden power. Using this method, we gain unique lessons regarding the exercise of women's power whether it be hidden, invisible, or visible. The exercise of women's power, according to Farzana Bari[12] is a social asset, and political capacity needs to be enhanced continuously.

Thus, we could say that women's passage from the private to the public realm in politics is a like that of a path through a forest; a test of women's capabilities to go over and above patriarchal obstacles. In order to overcome the constraints, women, collectively and individually, must use various strategies to unlock the previously closed patriarchal state arena in order to participate. Although in the short term access into politics has not proven to be effective in eliminating patriarchal systems in the state, we may regard the experiences of the women as lessons learned for other women, and as valuable insights on how to gradually negate the state's patriarchy.

2.1 RESEARCH METHOD

This study aims to describe state patriarchy and women's struggle to eliminate such patriarchal systems in Indonesia, Malaysia, Cambodia, the Philippines, and Timor-Leste. Research variables are limited to social and state institutions as the center of patriarchal influence and its replication, and women's struggle to overcome patriarchal barriers through the women's representation quota system. The goal of this study is to present lessons learned from women politicians in South-East Asia, which may be developed to promote and acheive gender equality.

Informants of this research were not only women who took part in the electoral system or members of Parliament (MP), but also researchers from the Philippines, Malaysia, Cambodia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste who were involved in this study. In a study such as this, which focuses on lessons from women in politics, knowledge and experience are not separate. A researcher from the Philippines was also member of a political party, while another researcher from Timor-Leste was a former member of Parliament. Meanwhile, researchers from Cambodia and Malaysia are Civil Society Organization (CSO) women activists as is the principal researcher in Indonesia. Another researcher from Indonesia is an academic and activist.

11   John Gaventa, *Finding the Spaces for Change: A Power Analysis*, (Institute of Development Studies: IDS Bulletin, Volume 37, Number 6, November 2006), 24-29

12   Bari, *Women's Political Participation*, op.cit

The data of this study has been obtained from informant interviews, including interviews with the researchers considering their experiences in breaking through patriarchal boundaries in their respective countries. This accounts for 50% of the data while the remaining 50% draws on secondary data from research findings regarding women in South-East Asia. This method was employed to obtain an extensive scope of patriarchal issues in the five countries, although this study is limited in terms of having to focus on specific patriarchal issues.

Research was conducted in three phases. First, principal researchers conducted assessments in Indonesia, Cambodia, the Philippines, Timor-Leste, and Malaysia to acquire general descriptions regarding the quota system and women's representation. Second, researchers from each country conducted assessments to identify the forms of patriarchal behavior and the barriers they created for women and the experiences of women overcoming them. The third phase was the verification and reconstruction of data acquired in the first phase (by principal researchers) and second phase (by researchers in the five countries).

2.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This study aims to answer the following research questions: (1) What is the background of patriarchy in Malaysia, Cambodia, the Philippines, Timor-Leste, and Indonesia and what is its role in creating and sustaining gender stereotypes? (2) What forms of patriarchy hinder women's political participation, from women's suffrage to the quota system? (3) What are the strategies used by women to overcome patriarchal barriers?

Chapter III

State-Patriarchy in South East Asia

3.1 THE LOSS OF PRIVATE-PUBLIC BOUNDARIES AND THE CREATION OF STATE FEMALE SYMBOLS

Patriarchy in South East Asia relates to the change of mobility of women from the private domain to the public domain. In the five countries being researched, the origin of this change can be traced to the colonial era. Prior to colonialism, Elizabeth Eviota[13] explains that patriarchy operated through an extended kinship group structure, which positioned women within the private structure, as a means of trade by marriage transactions, and were treated as family property.

The arrival of European merchants in South-East Asia, which then led to colonization, was not related to rice agriculture. Initially, merchants were seeking non-food commodities and extracting raw energy resources. Tracing the history of the Philippines, when Spain colonized the territory in 16th-17th century, Eviota discovers that Spanish missionaries from the Catholic Church rearranged the family structure, gender relations, and state relations. Extended family structures were changed to nuclear family structures to simplify its relation with the state. Although the interest of colonial governments was only to mobilize workers in the production process of commodity plants, the Church reorganized family structure to instill new values and morality based on Christianity.[14] The Portuguese employed similar methods during its colonization of Timor-Leste in the early 20th century, although according to John Taylor (1998)[15] the "Portuguesezation" only touched the surface of society. However, persistent Church leaders, especially the Dominicans, successfully reorganized the family structure as the foundation of a parochial society structure that blended with local traditions.

The rearrangement of the family structure, from an extended family to a nuclear family, impacted gender relations in the family. Studies by Eviota in the Philippines, Cecilia Ng and Maznah Mohamed [16] in Malaysia, and Ann Stoller[17] in Indonesia, show how men and women were mobilized into the public sphere as paid workers in colonial plantations, yet the public structure was built on gender segregation. Male workers were paid to work in colonial plantations, while female workers were mobilized as family members of the male workers. The colonial government of Spain in the Philippines[18] connected the position of men with colonial government institutions. Adult males were obliged to labor for 40 days in one year, performing colonial public works. Women as individuals were not bound by similar obligations,

---

13 Elizabeth Uy Eviota, *The Political Economy of Gender: Women and the Sexual Division Labour in the Philippines,* (London & New Jersey: Zed Books Ltd, 1992), 34

14 Eviota, *Political Economy of Gender*, Ibid, 35

15 John G. Taylor, *Perang Tersembunyi: Sejarah Timor Timur yang Dilupakan*, translated edition, (Jakarta: FORTILOS, 1998), 21-23

16 Cecilia Ng & Maznah Mohamed, *Primary but Subordinated: Changing Class and Gender Relation in Rural Malaysia*, dalam *Structures of Patriarchy, the State, The Community and the Household in Modernising Asia*, ed. Bina Argawal, (London: Zed Books, 1988), 52

17 Ann Laura Stoller, *Capitalism and Confrontation in Sumatra's Plantation Belt 1870-1979*, (University Michigan Press, 1995), *Introduction*

18 Eviota, *Political Economy of Gender*, op.cit, 48-60

but as members of society they were forced to work as unpaid laborers in order to fulfill production quotas. In Java Indonesia, fom the mid-19th century to the 1930s, women were mobilized to plantations in Deli[19] and Suriname. They went as wives of male workers (contract laborers) and mothers of children who, upon adulthood, would work in the plantations. Women were also employed, receiving wages far lower than men's.

Even though women were mobilized out of the private domain into the public arena, women's morals were upheld during the colonial periods of these countries. In the Philippines, as well as instilling Spanish traditions and morals, the Catholic Church also regulated boundaries for women and their ideology. The Catholic Church portrayed the Virgin Mary as a mother figure and as a female symbol for Filippino women to look up to. The purpose was to construct the holy patriarchal family (Holy Family) that ardently served the Spanish government[20]. The Virgin Mary was depicted as a woman who was the compassionate pillar of her family, according to the New Testament, but the interpretation of her role did not indicate power, compared to narrative concerning men's roles. The position and symbol of the Virgin Mary demonstrates the condition of Filipino women today.

According to Linda P. Perez[21] the reality even today, is that the most distinct roles expected of a woman are as a mother or a wife who dedicates her entire time to childrearing – by preparing food, bathing, and providing educational guidance and support at school and at home. This role might be true to a certain extent, as the culture and religion in the Philippines determine women's role as the primary caregiver in the household. In relation to role distribution based on gender, Norberto Batch Nano[22] describes a concept in Philippino society where the term for father is *Haligi ng Tahanan* meaning the foundation of the family and one who is expected to undertake the role as the primary bread winner in order to meet the family's needs. The term for mother is *Ilaw ng Tahanan* meaning one who is expected to carry out household chores, care for the children, and teach the children manners. Carol Sobritchea's[23] work explores past beliefs that regard women as emotional, doubtful, and physically weak beings and thus unable to take responsibilities in governmental positions. Therefore, a woman's contribution to society should only be within the scope of caregiver for her children and family.

In Timor-Leste, the majority of the population follow a patrilineal family system that is rooted in the extended family, and passed down from generation to generation, creating clans (*umakain*) as the basis of their social structure. As described by Sofi Ospina and Isabel de Lima[24] this social structure is still followed in Timor-Leste today. Furthermore, the clans live in different villages based on if they are from a royal clan or are commoners (outside the noble lineage). The royal clans control political and religious affairs executed by the eldest male in the clans. As such, political and religious knowledge is passed on by the fathers to their eldest sons. Meanwhile, women, even if they are the eldest child, do not have any position of power and their participation in decision making, both in private and public domains, is highly limited. In some communities, women are appointed as the proxy of men (*lian nain*) to guard their homes

---

19   Stoller, *Capitalism in Sumatra's Plantation*, op.cit, 14-25
20   Eviota, *Political Economy of Gender* op.cit, 39-40
21   Linda P. Perez, *The Filipino Woman's Role* in *The Humanization of Social Life*, ed. Christopher J. Wheatley et.al, (Washington: The Council for Research in Values and Philosophy, 2004)
22   Norberto Batch Nano, *Gender Education to Gender Sensitive Communication*,
23   Carol Sobritchea, *The Impact of* American Colonial Education *on Filipino Women*. in Asian Studies, volume 1-2 (1990)
24   Sofi Ospina and Isabel de Lima, *Participation Women in Politics and Decision Making in Timor-LesteTimor-Leste: A Recent History*, Unifem-Timor-LesteTimor-Leste Program Office, 14-15, http://www.cdi.anu.edu.au/x_GEN_D_P/2006_TL_Ospina.UNIFEM.REP.pdf

the heirlooms (*umaluik*) together with their husbands. Women also take part in traditional ceremonies as dancers and drummers, but not as leaders of the ceremonies. The marriage system is founded upon transaction and production means between the clans, and creates categories of wife-givers (*fetosan*) and wife takers (*umane*). The transactional system in marriage is called *barlake* and carried out through long negotiations between clan representatives, a process that builds kinship and solidary between clans. The transactional marriage system, the purpose of which is to create a social safety net, may in contrast put women in vulnerable situations, especially considering the customary practice of women entering their husbands' families and following the rules set by their in-laws (patrilocal system)[25].

Maria da Costa Exposto[26] describes how many parents in Timor-Leste, including hers, name their daughters 'Maria'. The Virgin Mary is a holy female symbol, a devout worshipper of God and a steadfast mother. However, during the struggle of national independence, both against Spain and Indonesia, a new female symbol of martyrdom was introduced. The female symbol was St. Maria Gorretti, a young devout woman whose death was caused by rape. The sacrifice of St. Maria Goretti was experienced by many women in Timor-Leste, especially during Indonesian military occupation. The emergence of St. Maria Goretti as new female symbol however has not not annulled the Virgin Mary's symbol of motherhood.

Did the colonial governments of the Britain and the Netherlands also reconstruct the extended family structure and created female symbols?

The organization of the nuclear family structure in Malaysia and Indonesia differ from the Philippines and Timor Leste. Islam was introduced to the Malay peninsula from as early as the 9th century by merchants from South Asia. According to Sylvia Frisk[27], during the British colonial period in Malaya the already deep-rooted practice of Islam was allowed to continue, under the control of the sultanates. The orientation of British colonial policies was to introduce the prerequisites of a modern state, namely the judicial and educational systems. Islam had its own concept concerning family piety, commonly known as *sakinah*. According to Frisk, Islamic teachings during that period did not eliminate the two extended family systems that existed in Malaya, known as *temenggong* (patrilineal) and *perpatih* (matrilineal) pertaining to land inheritance. *Temenggong* customs, which were patrilineal, even recognized land ownership by men and women, even though men were the decision makers[28]. However, the surge of Islam in the 15th century realigned the principle of equality between men and women. Through the concept of the world and salvation in the afterlife, women faced contradicting positions. On one hand, women and men were described as equal in the eyes of God, yet on the other hand women were portrayed as weak, emotional, and irrational compared to men when solving everyday problems. It was based on this view that women in the family environment were thought to need men to lead them. The implication of this belief affects not only land and property inheritance, in which women receive less than men, but also the emergence of Muslim women as examples to follow.[29]

The situation in Indonesia was similar to what took place in Malaya. Islam spread across the archipelago at almost the same period. Throughout the 14th and 15th centuries, Islamic teachings increased and spread

---

25   Ospina with T. Hohe in Ospina, *Participation Women in Politics*, ibid, 15
26   Maria da Costa Exposto, former member of the Timor-Leste Parliament
27   Sylvia Frisk, *Submitting to God: Women and Islam in Urban Malaysia*, (Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asia Studies, 2009), 27-62
28   See also Cecilia Ng and Maznah Muhamed, *Primary but Subordinated*, op.cit, 52
29   Frisk, *Submitting to God*, op.cit, 27-62

along the North Coast of Java, South Sulawesi, and Sumatera through trade and marriage between Muslim women with local noblemen. Their children became kings or rulers of lands, who continued to expand the influence of Islam[30] However, even though women took part as agents of Islamic expansion, women were deemed irrational, emotional, and lustful. This view was similar to Islamic views in Malaysia. The creation of female symbols in Indonesia and Malaysia was also distinct from the Philippines and Timor-Leste, who directly referred to the Virgin Mary. In Malaysia and Indonesia, symbolization referred to ethical categorizations of 'good' and 'bad'. A 'good' Muslim woman was characterized as a woman who was able to pardon her husband's beatings and tolerate his romantic affairs outside the marriage. A good mother was one who was always present at home to prepare the family's breakfast, pack a lunch for school, prepare the children's uniforms, including shoes and ties.[31] Marriage became a means to romanticize servitude instead of a partnership. However, being 'good' was not enough and in the end, women also needed to show devotion to God. Pious women, in Indonesia and in Malaysia, are termed *solihah.*

Dutch colonialism which began in Indonesia in the 18th century endorsed the moral alliance between "housewifezation" that was predominant in Javanese aristocratic traditions, with European Victorian and *solihah* morality[32]. The moral coalition supported the *koncowingking* concept of women within the nuclear family. *Koncowingking* is a term originating from Javanese aristocratic traditions that positioned women as the spouses of men whose functions were limited to the kitchen, bedroom, and bathroom areas to serve their husbands and children. This philosophy does not contradict the Islamic view of women being weak, emotional and irrational beings and thus needing to be led by men.[33]

During the French colonial period in Cambodia in the 19th century the Hindu-Buddhist tradition of the Khmer kingdom, that limited women's space and behavior, was allowed to continue. The religions viewed women as having uncontrollable sexual urges. Women were characterized by having bestial lusts, as well as strong desires for wealth and other worldly possessions. In the mid 19th century, a code of conduct called *Chbab Srey* was introduced with the purpose of controlling women's desires. *Chbab Srey* contained guidelines for women on how to become virtuous and gentle. Women had to be loyal to their husbands, serve their needs well, be able to cook, clean the house, take care of the children, and serve other family members including guests. *Chbab Srey* also called for unmarried women to dress well, to be demure, and act with grace and gentleness to attract men for marriage.[34]

The experiences in the Philippines, Cambodia, Malaysia, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste between the 16th and 20th century show that colonialism broke down the boundaries between public and private domains for women, although patriarchal control remained in both spheres. Women's participation in the public domain did not mean relinquishing duties in the private domain, or even personal liberation. Eviota[35]

---

30   M. Ikhsan Tanggok*, Orang China Menyebarkan Islam Sampai Indonesia*, dalam *Menghidupkan Kembali Jalur Sutra*, (Jakarta: Gramedia, Pustaka Utama, 2010)

31   Based on dialogues in television drama series aired in TV3 Malaysia, directed by Kabir Bathia, *Nur Kasih* (*Light of Love*), 2009, for further reference http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nur_Kasih

32   Medelon Djajadiningrat-Nieuwenhuis, *Ibuisme and Priyayization: Path or Power?* in Elsbeth Locher-Scholten and Anke Niehof (eds), *Indonesian Women in Focus: Past and Present Notions*, (Faris, 1987), 101

33   Ruth Indiah Rahayu, *Militerisme dan Ideologi Koncowingking: Pengukuhan Ideologi Perempuan Indonesia Secara Pemaknaan Ksatria* Jawa, dalam *(*2005), in *Warisan Otoritarianisme Orde Baru*, ed. F.X. Baskara Tulus Wardaya, *(*Jakarta: ELSAM and PUSDEP, 2007), 24

34   Mona Lilja, *Power, Resistance, and Women Politicians in Cambodia: Discourses of Emancipation*, (Denmark: NIAS Press, 2008), 70

35   Eviota, *Political Economy of Gender*, op.cit, 34-37

adds that the presence of European nations also altered kinship relations between the indigenous governance and the colonial government. The following section will narrate how women in South-East Asia have gone on to interact within state institutions.

3.2 INSTITUTIONS REPRODUCING STATE-PATRIARCHY

This section will discuss state institutions (formed by the state or society) that replicate patriarchal practices. As conveyed by Walby[36], there are three cultural institutions that are significantly patriarchal: schools through their curriculums, religious institutions, and the media. The colonial eras in the five countries serve as timeframes in history in which women as individuals first came into direct contact with state and cultural institutions.

3.2.1 Freedom and Control: Engagement of Education and Religious Institutions

Experiences in the Philippines, Malaysia, Cambodia, Timor-Leste and Indonesia show a correlation between attendance of girls at school with women's advancement in the public domain, even though curriculums even today still impart gender bias and distinctions, as promoted by dominant religions.

Schools in Cambodia only began to accept girls after the country declared independence in 1953. Under French rule, from 1884 schools which were managed by monks and only open for boys, were not allow to develop. It was not untuil the early 20th century that the French established alternative schools exclusively for elite Cambodian male students who would be hired as administrative staff in the colonial bureaucracy. and therefore focused on teaching French, When schools were opened for female students, *chbab srey* (the code of conduct for women) was a compulsory subject and taught from the elementary level. Here, female students were trained how to speak, walk, and articulate softly; they were not to scream or shout. Female students were also taught to be reserved, to restrain from showing any interests, their womanhood, or a desire for power[37].

Outside school, *Chbab Srey* was introduced by parents at home from when their daughters could walk. Even from infancy, mothers began to train their daughters to control sexual desires. Interview footage conducted by Smith-Hefner showed a mother, saying: "...if girl drink milk too long, they will be naughty. Boy, if they drink milk too long, they will be strong"[38] Viewing women as unable to control their desires and emotions, the period of breastfeeding for girls is limited, as a long period of breastfeeding would make them passionate. Boys, on the other hand, need to be breastfed longer so that they are strong, as in the future they will have to work for their families[39].

In Timor-Leste, opening access to education for girls became the underlying factor of change for women in the public domain. However, the great distances between home and schools serve as an obstacle for female students, especially those who live in rural areas. Parents do not normally allow their daughters to travel too far from their homes, as girls are thought to be vulnerable. This is also the reason behind the

---

36 Walby, *Patriarchy*, op.cit
37 John M. Collins, *Reconstructing Acces in the Cambodian Education Systemn*, in Domald B Holsinger, W. James Jacob, *Inequality in Education: Comparative and International Perspecetives*, (Hongkong: Comparative Education Research Centre-University of Hongkong, 2008), 108
38 Nancy J. Smith-Heffner, *Khmer American: Identity and Moral Education in a Disporic Community*, (California: University of California Press, 1999), verbatim quote
39 Nancy Smith-Heffner, *Khmer American*, op.cit

high drop-out rate among female students. Today, the Education Ministry of Timor-Leste in collaboration with the governments of Cuba and Brazil, provide informal schools for female students who have dropped out of school. The program's success in encouraging women's participation in education, however, has yet to be determined.

The poplutaion of Timor Leste is predominantly Catholic (over 90%), and as such the curriculum in Tmor-Leste is highly influenced by Catholic teachings. Catholic prayers are recited at the beginning and at the end of classes. Sister Eliza, a nun and teacher at a Catholic school said that there are no gender differences in the Catholic education system and learning process. All the subjects taught acknowledge equality of rights. However, there are unwritten rules that discriminate against female students. For instance, girls who become pregnant are expelled from school, but boys who are responsible for a pregnancy are not. The explanation given for this regulation is that signs of pregnancy are visible in girls and it may taint the school's image and affect the student's peer group. Sister Eliza expected female students to be well behaved in order not to attract the attraction of grown men who might seduce them. Sister Eliza went on to say that it is unfortunate if a female student should be expelled due to pregnancy or failure to guard her behavior. Therefore, Sister Eliza places a lot of emphasis on the behavior of girls and women in order for them to participate in education, or in the public domain.

The Church also differentiates between men and women. Men have the opportunity to become pastors, but women only have the opportunity to become nuns, who in principle assist the pastor. Education curriculums for pastors and nuns are also different as pastoral students prioritize the study of theology and philosophy, while those studying to become nuns only study the basic principles. It is argued that, since the responsibilities of the said roles weigh differently, the access to knowledge is also different.

The segregating nature of education and religious structures that separate male and female students in Timor-Leste is vital in shaping the mindset of Timor-Leste as a nation. For girls, the lesson of obedience to boys is stressed, in accordance with religious teaching 'women are created from the ribs of men'. This view is indoctrinated from generation to generation, and from a young age children are taught to accept gender differences and that girls are subordinate to men. Consequently, girls become used to their subordinate position in the family, and their dependence on men continues into adulthood. A typical example is when a young woman engages in a romantic relationship, first she is fearful of her male siblings, then she behaves as her companion wishes and this continues until they are married. The outcome, is that women are not used to making any decisions, and when they are encouraged to participate in the public domain they are reticent.

In Malaysia, women in general have equal access to education as men. In fact today female students in universities generally male students, however when women join the workforce their work choices are limited to positions they can take while taking care of their children. Frisk (drawing on the study of Roff and Syarifah)[40] traces evidence of women first being allowed to attend school back to the early 20th century, when the Youth movement initiated a reformation of traditional Islam. Prior to this, girls studied at home or at informal schools. They learned to read the Qur'an, studied the hadith, morals, and ethics. When the reformation movement began, the Youth encouraged women to step outside the private domain, to attend schools for boys and girls called *madrasah* (religious boarding school). The Youth movement also

---

40   Frisk, *Submitting to God*, op.cit, 27-62

brought about a change of perception of Islam from being based on interpretations by Ulamas to being based on the Qur'an and the Hadith. In *madrasahs*, female students who were regarded as irrational, studied to become rational. The model of the *madrasah* essentially replicated schools established by the British government – the *madrasah* was set up as alternative schools, as British schools were suspected of having Christian missions. Following Malaysia's independence in the 1950s, the country saw a great increase of female students at schools[41].

However, the surge of female students in public schools and the notion of female students studying to become rational beings was criticized by the Da'wah movement in the 1970s and 1980s. Ong[42] argued that the presence of female students in educational institutions lowered the authority of men. The Da'wah movement therefore attempted to restore men's authority by returning the moral portrayal of women as *solihah* mothers, wives, and daughters. The education for women was then focused on religious rituals and the covering of women's bodies and wearing of the *jilbab (hijab)*. A study by Klesser found female students being prohibited from participating in political parties or becoming members of political associations other than Da'wah groups.

Gender stereotyping was inserted into school syllabuses, through storytelling by teachers and in textbooks. The following sentence is an example taken from a language textbook: "Ali is always allowed to go out to play football with his friends while his sister, Aminah has to stay at home to help her mother cook lunch." The father was reading the newspaper or watching the news on television; sometimes, he joined in his wife's or children's activities, as long as he found the activities interesting. This is a typical example found in Malaysian textbooks. Gender stereotyping taught at schools continues and significantly influences the students' mindset. Often, it is the male student who is eligible to be elected as head of class or group, indicating that perception of men as leaders and women as followers has been deeply culturally embedded. Female students who are elected as group leaders are 'feminine' according to the "heteronormativity" norm.[43] At schools, there are even more male teachers than female teachers, except in all-female schools.

Lesson texts that are imbued with gender stereotyping such as *"Ali is playing football with his friends, while Aminah is at home helping mother cook,"* can still be found in elementary school textbooks in Indonesia, Timor-Leste, and the Philippines today. In Indonesia, such texts are inserted into Indonesian language lessons. It is interesting that the same pattern appears throughout South-East Asia, where private-public gender-based segregation is socialized formally through schools, yet on the other hand schools are where girls look to to gain equality. It is also interesting that segregation in education correlates with patriarchal structures in religious institutions and schools for religious leaders.

In her study on Indonesian women in the early 20th century, Cora Vredee van Stuers[44] described women's advancement as literacy to knowledge, which started when schools were established in West Sumatera, North Sumatera, Java, Manado, Flores and were opened to female students. The Dutch government

---

41   Frisk, *Submitting to God*, ibid
42   Frisk, *Submitting to God*, ibid
43   *According to the Oxford Dictionary: heteronormative (adj) denotes or relates to a worldview that promotes heterosexuality as the normal preferred sexual orientation. The term 'heteronormativity' is a terminology popularized by Michael Warner (1991) that refers to the concept from Gayle Rubin according the society's worldview that creates sex and gender hierarchy, which produces a set of norms for male and female characters. The female norms is associated with feminine characteristic – compassionate/attentiveness, wanting to protect, caring, and nurture others.*
44   Cora Vredee de Stuers, *Gerakan Perempuan Indonesia: Kemajuan dan Pencapaian*, translated edition, (Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu, 2008)

also set up public schools, where male and female students studied in classrooms together, as well as girls' schools teaching general subjects and girls' Islamic and Christian schools. There were also Islamic boarding schools and *madrasah*, but religious teachings were not included in public school curriculums until the mid 1970s. Instead of the Ministry of Education, it was the Ministry of Religious Affairs that developed and controlled the Islamic curriculum. At the start of 2000, Islamic schools outside the *madrasah* emerged; established up to senior high school level, these schools teach a general curriculum as well as Islamic teachings. Religious rituals are practiced from kindergarten where female students are introduced to full-clad uniforms of long skirts and blouses as well as jilbabs.

The strong link between education and religious institutions can also be found in the Philippines. The education system in the Philippines comprises public and private schools. Private schools are managed by Catholic congregations that provide funding and boarding, to prepare students before entering public schools. In addition, there are also schools managed by the Chinese community and the Protestant Church - *Iglesia ni Cristo* is a popular school. The Catholic Educational Association of the Philippines (CEAP) today has 1,252 schools as its members. The membership includes universities and academies offering college scholarship for the students. The CEAP also has 700 missionary schools offering elementary education for poor and marginalized families. In fact, there are more educational scholarships of greater sums provided by Catholic education institutions, than scholarships provided by state institutions. For instance, *Ateneo de Manila* and *de La Salle University* grant on average 53,000 peso in scholarships, compared to 22,500 peso from state universities - *University of the Philippines* and *Polytechnic University* for instance, only provide around 1,000 peso. Based on the amount provided by Catholic institutions, we can see the significant value that the Catholic Church brings to education in the Philippines. The quality of Catholic education also prompts large numbers of parents to send their children to Catholic schools.

This leads us to examine the message promoted by the Catholic Church regarding women and power. The most notable message is the exclusion of women in the church's hierarchy – cardinals, bishops, parochial pastors, and deacons are the positions of power. Having no women in the church's hierarchy, bishops' conferences in the Philippines are never attended by women. Women are also prohibited from performing sacraments. Meanwhile, cardinals, bishops, and parochial pastors are the leaders eligible to lead mass and have the authority to preach or convey their opinions.

Another strong message is the image and symbolism of the Virgin Mary, which is enthusiastically worshipped and sets an example for women to follow. It is the center of devotion for the Chursh's leaders and is the archetype for women. Refering to the Bishops' conference in the Philippines in 1975, in a "Pastoral Letter", 100 parochial pastors honored the Immaculate Conception, more than 60 were dedicated to Our Lady of the Holy Rosary, while others varied from *the Assumption*, *Our Lady of Carmel, Mother of Perpetual Help, Our Lady of Lourdes*, etc. An excerpt of the Bible in the "Pastoral Letter" reads as the follows: "The data we have from the Gospels concerning Mary are that she was betrothed to Joseph (Matthew 1:18; Luke 1:26.27) in Nazareth; that she was a virgin when she conceived. (Luke 1:27.34-35; Matthew 1:25; see also Luke 2:5) and that she gave birth to Jesus in Bethlehem (Matthew 1:25-2:1; Luke 2:4-7). Otherwise she is simply located at various places, always connected with her Son: in the hill country of Judea for Elizabeth's recognition of her unique maternity (Luke 1: 39ff.); at Jerusalem for her own purification in the Temple and the offering of the Child to God (Luke 2:22ff.); at Nazareth for the Child's rearing (Luke 2:51; Matthew 2:23); at Jerusalem for the discovery of Jesus speaking with the teachers in the Temple (Luke 2:42.46); at Cana for a wedding (John 2:1); and finally at Jerusalem when Jesus was crucified (John

19:25) and when the Holy Spirit comes upon the Apostles (Acts 1:8)." This example illustrates how the Virgin Mary, throughout the Bible, is socialized to Catholics in the Philippines, which account for 80% of the population. Mary is portrayed as the mother revered for her purity, fortitude, courage, sincerity and immolation to fulfill God's command. She is also the symbol of a woman who cares and loves her family wholeheartedly, yet her position of power is not visible.

The two messages above indicate the strong influence of Catholic values that are imparted through curriculums in private schools managed by Catholic leaders, public schools where the majority of teachers are Catholics, and masses led by pastors. These values are interjected in to textbooks and enhanced by the teachers' explanation. Moreover, most of the officials in the Department of Education, authors, teachers, and other education stakeholders are Catholic. In Catholic schools, there is also the practice of separating male and female students, such as the policy of Don Bosco, an all male school, and St. Paul's College and College of the Holy Spirit for female students. Catholic values are institutionalized robustly and greatly influence the social structure of the society, including women. All the above demonstrate how Catholic-based education is not limited to teaching women what they should or should not do. These narratives serve to highlight how religious leaders and teachers transform values and knowledge that hamper women from entering the political arena, despite the fact that the women's literacy rate (93.3%) is very close to men's (93.7%) and the school participation rate for female students, both at schools managed by Catholic institutions and at public schools, is 2% higher than male students.

In addition, teachings at church emphasize the deepening and strengthening of faith according to the guidelines in the Ten Commandments through policies formulated by men through the church's hierarchy, both domestically and in the Vatican. Women in general devote themselves to serving at mass (assisting the pastor), the Church's hierarchy, and the Ten Commandments, while men carry out core duties in relation to power. Similarly, at schools, female students receive in-class education while male students are exposed to outdoor challenges.

3.2.2 Socialization of Female Symbols in the Media

The media today is one of democracy's vital pillars but is contradictive towards women. On the one hand, the media legitimizes women's contributions in politics, yet on the other hand reproduces gender stereotypes and becomes a means to control women. Very often the media portrays female symbols using examples of sinful or evil women, such as witches, or depicts women's bodies as sexual objects through pornography. Women who are actively engaged in politics, the economy, or culture are surrounded by this humiliating and belittling female symbolism.

The majority of the population in the Philippines has access to the media, which influences the daily social behavior and values of women, men, children, and political decision-makers. With electricity reaching all of the Philippines, almost all households can now listen to and watch radio and television broadcasts, while the middle class is familiar with social media such as Facebook and Twitter. According to the Gender Media Monitoring Project (GMMP)[45], the media allows room for patriarchal power to subdue women and exert unfair treatment. GMMP data concludes the following: (1) *Blatant* – gender labeling is instilled in news from around the world, (2) many news items are reported using language and

---

45   *Gender Media Monitoring Project*, http://www.allvoices.com/contributed-news/12289733-gender-education-to-gender-sensitive-communication

imagery that is gender-biased, (3) news frequently presents misguided analysis, at all levels, concerning the difference between male and female genders, (4) a great number of scripts (drama, movies) confirm gender stereotypes and position women as resigned, powerless characters when facing problems.

Cases of violence against women, such as domestic abuse by husbands beating their wives, are highly prominent in the news. Furthermore, the police treat the victims (the wives) as the offenders, while the men (the husbands) are acquitted. Worse, national television watched by an audience of millions, repeatedly broadcasts such cases. Consequently, the socialization of cases and the legal stance taken by the police further corroborate society's image of women as lacking morals. At the same time, the media demonstrates women as sexual objects in advertisements for products such as alcoholic beverages, men's clothing, and so forth, where women are placed in contrast to men's superiority. For example a tag line for a beer product says, "Men should act like Men" by consuming the product, this implies "Men should not act like Women". The advertisement also shows a woman's body that is irrelevant to the product.

In Malaysia, gender-based assumptions are formed and controlled by the Government through popular media. Most mainstream print media such as Utusan Malaysia, The Star, Berita Harian, The Sun and Sin Chew, and television channels such as TV3, NTV7, TV9, RTM1 and RTM2 are owned and controlled by the Government of Malaysia, or by a political component of the Barisan Nasional coalition. These media entities serve the interests of the ruling party and sabotage reports of the opposition. Thus, Malaysians are deprived of alternative political aspirations other than those of the Government. Realizing the sabotage, opposion parties use alternative media to communicate their views and political actions.

Gender stereotyping is common in the Malaysian media. Time and time again, women are perceived as the weaker gender and hard workers. A 'good' wife is one who dutifully complies with all her husband's rules without question despite any actions he may take against her. A wife who, in spite of her laborious work at home caring for the family, even perhaps at the workplace as well, needs to stay compliant to her husband's rules. Such is the portrayal of a 'good' Muslim woman disseminated by the media that applies to all, including female politicians. Other examples of being a 'good' Muslim wife are enduring a husband's beatings or affairs. As a 'good' mother, she would always be at home to prepare her family's meal and perform other chores to maintain the house's condition.

The media also portrays women as having a high appeal or entertainment value – this approach is also taken on by the alternative media. The opposition will use stories and imagery of women politicians in the ruling party to victimize them and put them down. Rosmah Mansur, wife to the sixth Prime Minister, Mohamad Najib, is an excellent example. Rosmah was not a politician, yet was highly involved in a Malaysian political drama, creating an image of herself as being more distinguished compared to the wives of previous prime ministers. Rosmah was highly criticized as she was perceived as extravagant and meddling too much with her husband's political affairs. She was also slammed for paying too much attention to her appearance. Shahrizat Jalil, the former Minister for Women and a member of the Senate at the Dewan Negara (National Hall) is another example. Shahrizat was forced to step down after a very public cattle business scandal involving her husband and children. Women politicians such as Rosmah and Shahrizat are easy targets for the media, and through their scandals their ruling party was destabilized. These kinds of incidents create a negative precedence for all women who are actively engaged in the politics.

Prior to the 2012 election in Timor-Leste, *Caucus Feto Iha Politica* or the Timor-Leste Women's Caucus, signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with several print media and radio stations. The MoU addressed the media's role to report gender-sensitive news, including promoting women's participation in politics and the electoral process. However, the MoU was dishonored and was not executed as expected. According to the Timor-Leste Women's Caucus, the MoU breach was due to a lack of understanding among media workers regarding the importance of women's participation in politics. As a consequence, the media was reluctant to report on women's political activities. Typically, the media only interviewed male officials, the President or political parties as sources. A woman politician, who was also the leader of *Uninade Nacional*, Fernanda Borges, was never covered even though her party failed to meet the parliamentary threshold during election.

The impact of minimum media attention on women was the people's lack of knowledge concerning the struggle, participation and contributions made by women in politics. This affected the public's perception of the capability and potential of women as political actors. To overcome this obstacle, one of the efforts led by women's organizations in Timor-Leste was to hold gender-sensitive training for media workers, aimed at raising gender awareness and more news coverage about women.

In Indonesia, the female symbol of a 'good' and active woman in the public domain has been socialized by women's magazines since the 1970s. Several popular magazines such as *Femina, Kartini, Sarinah,* and *Dewi* illustrate women's dual roles. Despite having a career in the politics, finance, or social institutions, a woman does not reject her role as a housewife in the private domain. The idea of a dual role has become a female model among well-educated women, who occupy professional positions with substantial salaries. These women successfully compete with men, but they may not be entirely present in the public domain. Their responsibilities in the private sphere as wives and mothers also need to be carried out. In addition, these women are also depicted as lifestyle consumers due to their trendy, fashionable appearance. This idea was highly prominent in the 1990s. At the same time, women's tabloids emerged, publishing gossip on women in the public domain related to politicians, celebrities, and other career women, highlighting the emotional aspect instead of rational aspect. Women who cry are overwhelmingly exploited, however at the same time some women politicians who have been caught up in corruption scandals have tried to use the media to portray themselves as 'good' and chaste.

The media only covers women's participation in the politics when women lead demonstrations on the streets. Political activity by women within the Parliamentary Women's Caucus or in political parties is deprived of coverage. This kind of behavior is due to the way the Indonesian media tends to prioritize events, scandals and cases, while the activity of women in politics is not deemed newsworthy.

In Cambodia, the media is controlled by the ruling party [46], the Cambodian People's Party (CPP),), which crushes views that are contrary to the Government's. Even the alternative media refrain from openly criticizing the Government. Women's political activities, therefore, receive no attention from the media. However, there is news and advertising that perpetuate violence against women and undermines respect towards women. Based on analysis carried out by the Women's Media Centre [47], a quarter of all articles or news in the media depict women in a pornographic context, and more than 80% describe obscene

---

46   Tive Sarayeth, *Media Reform Experiences in Cambodia*, a paper presented at the *Beyond Media* Education symposium in Manila, 20-25 September 2010, waccglobal.org/.../658-Media-reform-experiences, downloaded on 2 October 2013

47   Tive Sarayeth, *Media Reform*, results of the *Women's Media Centre* monitoring in Cambodia between1996-1998, ibid

aspects of women's bodies. Women are also victimized; there are numerous articles that contain threats and condemnation towards women who are deemed to have violated the norms of society, including in cases of domestic abuse. Meanwhile, television companies air television dramas that further promote women's roles in the household as the obedient mother and wife, and at the same time as a sexual objects or attractive mistresses. Cambodian media persecutes women and is the arm of a patriarchal culture that preserves the stereotype of women as house ornaments and a source of entertainment.[48]

As outlined above, the continual dominance of patriarchal structures in the societies of the five South-East Asian countries of this study, is still unchallenged despite women's accessibility to the public domain. Religious teachings support the patriarchal position through educational institutions and religious rituals, while the free market, through the media, depicts women as tradable objects, even though the media circulates feminine values and symbols as constructed by religious teachings. The media combines cultural and market ideas that symbolize women as two extremes, 'good' and 'evil' and as such their moral standards are ambiguous.

---

48   Tive Saravayeth, *Media Reform*, Ibid

Chapter IV

Women's Struggle to Break the State Patriarchal Barrier

4.1 POLITICAL REFORM AND ROOM FOR WOMEN'S POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

The 1990s marked a change in political systems in countries across South-East Asia towards transition and democracy. Preceding other countries, in 1986 pro-democracy movements in the Philippines saw Corazon Aquino become the first female president in South-East Asia. The Women's movement was central in supporting the people overthrow martial law during the Marcos era. In 1979 Cambodia held 'free and open' elections following the end of the Khmer Rouge regime. Contributions by women were important in the reconciliation and democracy reconstruction process, although Cambodia did not have female Prime Minister until 1998. Indonesia experienced political reform through the 1999 election and the amendment to five Political Laws which opened the doors for women to participate in politics. The onset of democracy in Timor-Leste was the country's independence in 1999, when Timor-Leste created opportunities for women's participation. In Malaysia, political reform started after the economic crisis swept over South-East Asia and was led by Anwar Ibrahim in 1998. In 1999, the Women's Candidacy Initiative was established, formed by women activists as a channel to advocate for women's agendas. This decade seemed to echo women's movements during the struggle for independence, with its considerable contributions.

Demands for political reform that evolved in the five countries sparked a political desire to democratize the previously authoritarian system and its laws. Nonetheless, in terms of gender equality in politics, the national constitutions of the five countries do not stipulate a 30% quota system for women. The following table shows the levels of acceptance of the women's quota in the five countries.

Tabel 1. Quota System Implementation in Five South-East Asian Countries

Country	Constitutional Quota for National Parliament	Election Law Quota for National Parliament	Constitutional Quota at Sub National Level
Malaysia	No	No	-
Indonesia	No	Yes	-
Cambodia	No	No	
Philippines	No	No	Yes
Timor-Leste	No	Yes	-

Except for Indonesia and Timor-Leste, the quota system is not even applicable in the electoral systems of Malaysia, Cambodia, and the Philippines. Although Indonesia and Timor-Leste implement a women's quota in their electoral systems, only Timor-Leste has managed to attain 32.3% represenation by women while Indonesia has only an 18.2%. representation. Meanwhile, the Philippines only applies a women's

quota at its sub-national Parliament level, where 22.9% of its representatives are women, a higher figure than in Indonesia. Unfortunately, political reforms in Cambodia and Malaysia have not been able to create more opportunities for women to participate in the parliamentary or legislative electoral process.

4.2 FROM WOMEN'S SUFFRAGE TO A WOMEN'S QUOTA SYSTEM

The women's quota system is part of the women's suffrage struggle, the earliest form of women's fight against state patriarchy in the history of democratic countries. The term 'women's suffrage' refers to a movement that encompasses social-political-economic reforms demanded by women through voting rights in elections. This movement began in the early 20th century in the Philippines, Indonesia, and Malaysia, at the same time as the independence movements. In Timor-Leste and Cambodia, women's suffrage rose when the women's quota system was mandated by democratic countries around the world.

The demand of women's suffrage in the Philippines first arose during American settlement in 1901 after the end of Spainish rule. When the US government founded the Parliament in 1906, the Philippine Women's movement used the opportunity to demand women's suffrage. Women activists such as Conception Felix established *Asociacion Feminista Filipino,* and Pura Villanueva Kalaw formed *Asociacion Feminista Ilonga* – both aimed at fighting for women's suffrage in the House of Representatives in 1907[49].

 At present, democracy in the Philippines has led to political access for women. Women are now able to advance and compete with male politicians, and win legislative positions and as well as positions in the sub-national government. This access, and the process to acquire it in particular was made possible by interest groups such as women organizations and CSOs represented in Parliament. Although the government has not realized the 30% quota for women's membership in Parliament, women politicians have been able to secure seats and maintained their positions through elections.

 For women, the elections are not unlike an immense wilderness. Registration for elections is open for women and local government encourages men and women to be register as permanent voters. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and mass organizations also organize women through political education for voters to explain what political participation through election signifies. Members of the public are trained to produce criteria for candidates based on the interests of the people and to be able to to evaluate candidates.,These organizations also help to establish some sort of information center and invite residents to register as permanent voters.

To create a democratic institution that represents the people's interests, the Government of the Philippines issued regulations that required the listing of national political parties, regional organizations, and sector and mass-based organizations in the Legislative. The regulation was passed in 1995 and implemented in 1998 election, where the Party List-System was based on principles of proportional representation. This system determines 20% of the total seats in the Lower Chamber, be reserved for national political parties, regional organizations, and sector and mass-based organizations. Elected parties or organizations, or those who win significant votes in the national election, are eligible to take up a seat in Congress based on voting proportions acquired at elections. The Party List-System encourages more participation from other civil society organizations in the electoral politics. This system prevents the public and organisations

---

49   Eviota, *The Political Econonomy*, op.cit, 61-62

from determining which particular candidates should stand in Congress and limits them from having access to politicians and articulating their agendas. The Party List-System was implemented to promote democracy that represents more of the people's interests.

Women's suffrage in Indonesia grew from the Dutch Women's Suffrage Association (DWSA) in the Netherlands, which established a branch in Indonesia in 1908. It demanded the right to elect and the right to be elected, for Caucasian women, as members of *Dewan Praja* in Jakarta, Semarang, and Surabaya. In the 1920s Indonesian women started to collaborate with DWSA in order to participate in state politics. In July 1938 at the third Indonesian Women Congress in Bandung, the women's suffrage issue, which was then concerned with Indonesians becoming members of city councils, was discussed. The Congress resulted in a mandate to advocate women's suffrage for Indonesian women as part of the Women's movement's goals in that period. However, the women's suffrage policy for Indonesian women was only granted by the colonial government on the night the Pacific War broke, in 1942[50]. Following independence on 17 August 1945, the demand for women's suffrage was accommodated in the 1945 Constitution. However, despite inclusion in the Constitution, between 1955 to the 1999 election, women's suffrage only generated a low proportion of women's representation in Parliament[51].

The 30% quota system for women stipulated in Law No. 12, 2003 concerning Elections was a successful breakthrough for women's suffrage in Indonesia, both at national and sub-national levels, despite the target not being met.. In West Sumatera, even though its local customs follow a matrilineal system it did not have a significant impact on fulfilling the women's quota. In Legislative elections in 2004, women's representation reached only 9.09% ,which increased 12.73% in 2009.

In Timor-Leste, the Women's movement originated from the *Frente Revolucionaria de Timor-Leste Independente* (Fretilin). When Rosa Bonaparte unfolded the Timor-Leste independent flag on 28 November 1975, Indonesia launched its military invasion. In the 1990s, women's organizations sprang up in Timor-Leste, with affiliations to women's organizations in Indonesia. After Timor-Leste's independence from Indonesia, one of the outcomes of the women's struggle was an assurance for the protection of women in the State Constitution. The Constitution voices equality and non-discrimination for all, in particular equality between men and women, including in political participation.

The success of the quota system in Timor-Leste cannot be separated from the role of *Rede Feto,* supported by NGOs, farmers, university students, judges, lawyers, and members of Parliament. *Rede Feto* is an umbrella organization for 24 women's organizations representing thousands of women. *Rede Feto* was started by women who were involved in the underground movement during the fight for independence, those who lived in the forest and abroad. Together with NGO activists, they held their first congress in 2000. On the congress agenda were discussions on laws for the protection of women, a quota system, and health issues. Results of the discussions were formulated as a women's interests agenda. All the initiatives, ideas, and agendas were integrated into a strategic plan and analyzed for submission to Parliament and the UN organisations present at the time.

---

50   Susan Blackburn, *Women and the State in Modern Indonesia*, (Cambridge University Press, 2004), Introduction.
51   Ruth Indiah Rahayu, *Penetapan Sistem Kuota 30% Perempuan di Indonesia: Tinjauan Sejarah*, research paper in collaboration with Kalyanamitra, Jakarta, 2008

The successful outcome of this strategy was a 30% quota for women, stipulated in the Constitution. Initially, the composition of male and female MPs was 4:1, this was revised to 3:1. The *Rede Feto* congress also discussed women's role in government. The second *Rede Feto* congress examined the power of the police and the military, while the third congress discussed the formation of the Secretary of Sate for the Promotion of Gender Equality (SEPI). *Rede Feto* also debated Govenment programs and reviewed health, education, infrastructure development, agriculture, justice, security, and economic programs, assessing gender mainstreaming within the programs, and generated recommendations for improvements. It needs to be noted here that the NGO and the Government are two collaborating entities.

The success of the quota system in Timor-Leste also correlates with the presence of international agencies, including the United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor (UNTAET), during the establishment of a transitional government that built upon international conventions such as the Convention of Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). Timor-Leste, aside from being a new independent democratic country, also allows all of its citizens to participate in the politics.

To accommodate aspirations and to initiate women's empowerment, Gender Affairs was founded. The women's group had a major role in preparing the women of Timor-Leste to be more actively involved in the politics. Cooperating with several international organizations, Gender Affairs advocated for the 30% quota to be included in the electoral law, to ensure women's inclusion in the General Assembly election. Although to begin with the 30% quota was widely criticized, even by women, the proposal was eventually approved and ratified in Timor-Leste electoral law. Following the ratification, women's representation in the General Assembly in 2004 reached 20% (22 out of 88), it increased to 29.2% in the 2007 election (19 out of 65) and in 2012 it exceeded the quota reaching 38.5% (25 out of 65). The accomplishment of surpassing the women's quota target of 30% was also contributed to the CEDAW ratification and equality of rights stipulated in the Constitution.

Women's participation in politics in Malaysia was, quite unexpectedly, driven by the women's wing in political parties rather than by civil society movements. Post World War II, the first women's wing of the Malay National Party (MNP), named *Angkatan Wanita Sedar* (AWS), was founded in 1946. The British government went on to dissolve MNP and the AWS. AWS activists joined various other organizations, including *Pergerakan Kaum Ibu*. In 1947, *Pergerakan Kaum Ibu* supported male domination in the United Malays National Organisation (UMNO), and womens issues faded. In 1954 ahead of the 1955 general elections Khadijah Sidek, head of the women's wing of UMNO, called for women's representation in political parties and Parliament, however she was subsequently dismissed from the party. Eventually, Malay women entered state politics through the inter-ethnic consociational[52] model (ensuring representation of the minority) and in 1963 the multi-ethnic National Council Women's Organization was established. However, women's participation became even more limited. In the mid 1980s, women organizations within civil society organizations emerged, focusing on the issue of violence against women[53].

---

52 Malaysia is a multi-ethnic country. To manage power sharing and in order to avoid ethnic conficts, an ethnic representation model was devised. Women in Malaysia during the 1950s used the consociational model to garner women's representation in political parties, Parliament, and Government.

53 Maznah Mohamed, Cecilia Ng, Tan Beng Hui, *Feminism and the Women's Movement in Malaysia: An Unsung (R) evolution*, (Oxon & New York: Routledge, 2006)

Women constitute 50% of Malaysia's population. From 30 positions in the ministerial cabinet, only one position is occupied by a woman, the Minister of Tourism. Meanwhile, Shahrizat Abdul Jalil, former Minister for Women's Affairs, Family, and Community Development was requested to resign due to a corruption scandal involving her husband. Shahrizat Abdul Jalil's vacant post is now occupied by the Prime Minister, Tun Najib Razak. It should be noted that other than occupying the Minister for Women post, Tun Najib Razak also serves as Minister of Finance.

Malaysia's 10th election on 5 May 2013 was an important moment. For the first time, a woman from a civil society organization put herself forward as a candidate. Zaitun Mohammed Kasim[54], popularly known as Toni Kasim, was one of the founders of the Women's Candidacy Initiative (WCI) in the 1998 election. She was the first female independent candidate who participated in the 1999 election for the Selayang area. She did not succeed in her candidacy, but she garnered 30,000 votes. WCI then actively advocated for women candidates, especially those who fought for gender fairness. In 2013, prior to the election, *Mama Bersih* founded by *Persatuan Kesadaran Komuniti Selangor* declared a manifesto[55]. The manifesto contained eight demands regarding gender fairness, the election system, economic development, and privileges provided for candidates during the campaign period. Three demands were addressed at Federal and Government levels in regards to the legal assurance for a 30% women's quota. However, their demands received little attention from both the Government and the public.

Cambodia has a population of 13.8 million, 52% of which are women. The Cambodian Constitution has been in effect since 1993 and implements a structure consisting of a National Assembly (lower house), Senate (upper house), and Commune Councils. When the issue of gender disparity grew in Cambodia, Parliament's response was quite advanced. However despite policies being in place to encourage more women's representation, the reality is that women account only for 20% in the National Assembly, 15% in Senate, and less than 18% in Commune Councils[56].

Despite a lower than 30% representation of women, women's participation in politics has increased since 1993 and women are very active in advocating issues concerned with their communities. However, there are some fundamental barriers that women face when taking part in politics, namely economic and socio-cultural obstacles, and a political situation that is not conducive for women[57]. There are NGOs that promote women's participation in order to generate a political mechanism based on gender fairness, yet political support remains low. FUNCINPEC was the only political party that implemented a 30% women's quota in its list of candidates for the National Assembly Elections in July 2013. This, however, was an unwritten rule. Other political parties such as the Cambodian People's Party (CPP), the Cambodia National Rescue Party (CNRP), and the Lead for Democracy Party (LfDP) are also in support of having women in politics, nevertheless they reject the quota system, as in their view the system would discriminate against men[58].

---

54 Toni Kasim was a woman activist involved in Sisters in Islam (SIS), *Suara Rakyat Malaysia* (Suaram), the Joint Action Committee and the Women's Candidacy Initiative. She passed away in 2008 due to illness.

55 Empower Malaysia, http://empowermalaysia.org/blog/2013/04/16/mamabersihs-manifesto/ downloaded on 2 October 2013

56 Mona Lilja, *Power, Resistance, and Women Politician in Cambodia*, (Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, 2008),

57 Gabriella Sethi, *Increasing Women's Political Representation and Participation in Cambodia through the Implementation of Gender Quota*, executive summary (CCHR, 2013)

58 Gabriella Sethi, *Increasing Women's Political*, Ibid

At the National Assembly level (directly elected), from 1993 to 2008 women's representation increased from 6% to 22%, while at the Senate level (indirectly elected) women's representation reached only 14.75% (CCHR data, 2012). Meanwhile, at the Commune Councils level (directly elected), from 2002-2012, there was an increase of women elected as First Deputy from 7.55% to 9.27%. The position of women elected as Chairman of Commune decreased from 4.93% in 2002 to 4.66% in 2012, but the overall number of women elected as members of the Commune Councils increased.[59]

After ananlyzing efforts and examples of attempts to attain the 30% quota for women's representation, it is clear that the influence of an egalitarian culture is necessary. One critical element to explain women's success in politics is the support of their political institutions. Women need to be actively engaged in political parties and involved in political decision-making, without abandoning women's organizations or civil society networks that promote the women's quota system. Institutional governance also plays a key role in supporting women in their struggle to acquire higher representation. Higher political participation of women in this region would embolden other women around the world, who are currently fighting for greater access to political power.

4.3 PATTERNS OF PATRIARCHAL BARRIERS TO WOMEN'S REPRESENTATION

The low representation of women in politics in Malaysia may be due to the politicization of religion. The Islamization, or perhaps more appropriately the Arabization, of society, state and laws in Malaysia began in the early 1980s under the leadership of Mahathir Mohamad. Both UMNO and the Pan-Malaysia Islamic Party (PAS) emphasized the Islamization of the country as the key to building a successful state, and competed with each other to garner votes from the Malay-Muslim community. Apart from gaining votes, UMNO's Islamization agenda was also aimed at defining a multi-ethnic Malaysia as a country founded upon Islamic rules, including in its political system. This idea produced even greater social discrepancy in a diverse society, creating separate social lives in a polarized culture.

The cultural barriers mentioned above stemmed from one factor – religious interpretation. In Malaysia, faith is not a private matter, but instead, it is a matter of the state. Islam is the source of public and state policies, regulating how Islam should be practiced and obeyed by its citizens. Unfortunately, the perspective of Islam adopted by the state determines that women may not be leaders, and this affects how women are regarded and treated. Equality is ensured, but only within the definition of Islam by the state, which is largely based on a protectionist approach.

Out of 30 positions in the ministerial cabinet, only one position is occupied by a woman, the Minister for Tourism. Meanwhile, Shahrizat Abdul Jalil, Minister for Women's Affairs, Family, and Community Development was requested to resign due to a corruption scandal involving her husband. Shahrizat Abdul Jalil's vacant post is now occupied by the Prime Minister, Tun Najib Razak. It should be noted that other than occupying the Women's Affairs, Family, and Community Development post, Tun Najib Razak also serves as the Minister of Finance.

Responding to the Prime Minister's triple roles, Chong Eng, a politician from the opposition party, wrote on a website that the undertaking of multiple roles was essentially a betrayal against the *Tanjong* Declaration,

---

59   *Politics in the Kingdom*, published by CCHR in collaboration with Partnership, 2013

which supports the establishment of a ministry for women in order to acheive fair development for women. Malaysia is now stagnant in terms of gender equality. This situation also reflects the Prime Minister's insensitivity and *Barisan Nasional*'s lack of seriousness in delegating leadership positions to more suitable candidates. Chong Eng went on to say that in future elections, he would ensure no women voters would vote for *Barisan Nasional* led by Najib Tun Razak.

With the Prime Ministry undertaking the post of Minister for Women's Affairs, Family, and Community Development, and the low representation of women in the Malaysian Parliament, it may said that the position of women and their advancement lag far behind other countries in the region. The status of women in the Malaysian political arena, as conveyed by Wan Azizah, is not represented by Malaysian political institutions. Cho Eng described that in general, Malaysian politics was still closed to women. To increase the number of women in Parliament, a compulsory quota proportionate system is implemented. This is a seat reserve method similar to Timor-Leste. Curiously, in 1999, when a political tsunami took place, votes for the opposition rose from 41 to 81 seats. This may be one of the causes that slightly changed the women's composition in Parliament, as opposition parties selected more women candidates to represent the parties. Regrettably, women in Parliament have never spoken about women's agendas other than the celebration of International Women's Day. The Women's Caucus in Parliament is also void of supporters – a situation that is the opposite to the situation in the state of Penang, which now has Women's Development Cooperation.

The increase of women's representation in Parliament in fact, does not necessarily ensure a favorable situation for women's agenda. It is crucial that women's representation in Parliament is accompanied by capacity enhancement for women representatives. In politics itself, women's representation seems to be a fading issue. Without strong political will, especially from male politicians, women will not be able to enter an arena overwhelmed by a a male influence.

In the Philippines, female voters do vote for women candidates. However, if this situation is further scrutinized, we see that during elections many candidates are in fact women who are replacing their husbands, fathers, or sons, whose office term have expired. It may be said that women who hold positions in Parliament only do so until their husbands, fathers, or sons, are eligible to return to Parliament after three years. For women candidates, entering politics is not a personal decision as they are dutifully following the directions of their husbands, fathers, or sons. As a result, these women politicians are not targeting strategic positions as a career in politics is not their ultimate goal.

Women in the Philippines have proven that they are able to carry out their responsibilities and duties in the political domain alongside their male counterparts. However, gender stereotypes based on religious beliefs that have been ingrained from childhood might explain why their political representation has not been satisfying. Women who are able to participate in politics are seen to have burst through the masculine glass ceiling. J. Silvestre[60] points out that the popular symbol used to identify with women in the Philippines is the Madonna[61], "semi-divine, morally excelled, and spiritually stronger", and therefore women are perceived as being more resilient to corruption than men. This characteristic is one of the cultural factors that is logically accepted by the public regarding female political leaders.

---

60   Silvestre, http://www-mcnair.berkeley.edu//2001journal//Jsilvestre.html
61   Other name for Saint Mary the Virgin

Annabelle C. Tangson, president of the Lady Municipal Mayors Association of the Philippines, states that women leaders, elected as government officials, show better performance because they incorporate the caring and nurturing characteristics of women, while demonstrating more robust and fair leadership compared to men. According to Prosperina D. Tapales[62], modern society in the Philippines has made progress in its electoral system by initiating women-oriented programs. Women perform well as leaders, although in general Filipino women earn their seats due to their fathers' or husbands' political connections in the 'dynasty system', which limits the possibility of other Filipino women to be elected. Another factor that hinders women's outright involvement in politics is their great responsibility in the household. According to a study by L.V. Castro, the percentage of women trained in making decisions in the household is 59.1% higher than men. Women's deep entrenchment in the household correlates with low participation levels in politics, thus there were only 18.4% women elected as MPs in 2010 compared to 81.6% men.

Furthermore, women in general, are also regarded as weaker than men. One example is former president Corazon Aquino who had to endure sexism in an intensely masculine political environment. She had to suffer from derogatory insults such as "female fishmonger", despite her firm views. She was also accused of being the "coward who hides under her bed" after a failed coup attempt to overthrow her. Meanwhile, her participatory and consultative style was construed as signs of weakness and incompetence that were associated with her femininity. However, when a male leader adopts her leadership approach, he receives praise and is considered a leader who follows democratic principles.

The other significant characteristic of politics in the Philippines is the dominance of political dynasties, which are rooted in elite families with political power and economic wealth accumulated from the colonial era. These families constitute the center of political power that determine the Government's agenda. According to the University of the Philippines, out of 15 million families in the Philippines, there are 250 dominating political dynasties at national and local levels. This means that 94% of all the provinces in the Philippines have a political dynasty.

The participation of political dynasties in politics is not based upon platforms, and agendas but on strategic alliances to secure their win in elections in order to maintain the political and economic power of their families. Political alliances themselves are often adjusted which is not an unusual tactic employed by the candidates and their families. As such, politics in the Philippines tends to rely on popularity and influence rather than competition on political platforms and programs, and a solid track record. Currently, elections in the Philippines is a contest of popularity and wealth, two aspects that the political dynasties have in abundance. Here lies the critical challenge for mainstreaming of women's agendas.

Political dynasties similar to the Philippines are also present in Indonesia. The first female president, Megawati Sukarnoputri, is the daughter of Sukarno, Indonesia's declarer of independence and first president. Megawati started to gain popularity when, she was made a symbol of opposition to the New Order regime by her party, *Partai Demokrasi Indonesia* (PDI). Violent attacks on PDI's office on 27 July 1996, which claimed a number of victims, shaped a new party, *Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan* (PDI-P), as well as new form of political fight using Sukarno's pro-people image through Megawati as the party's symbol. When Megawati participated in the 1999 election, several Islamic leaders declared

---

62   Shah, Angilee. Women's Political Role on Rise in Philippines, 14 October 2005, http://www.international.ucla.edu/article.asp?parentid=31539 downloaded on 26 May 2013

that "women may not lead" which they supported with quotes from the Qur'an. However, Megawati was elected President in 2001 and was given the nickname, the "housewife."[63]

Following Megawati's election and the stipulation of a 30% quota system in the Election Law, the participation of women politicians contesting in legislative and executive elections increased. The Deputy Secretary General of the Golkar party's Central Leadership Board (DPP) Nurul Arifin, acknowledged that the dynasty influence in politics was indeed rising. Nurul Arifin stated that this illistrated how democracy could create political dynasties and explained that the party was unable to forbid or restrain dynasty politics. According to her, to meet the 30% quota of women as legislative candidates, a number of wives and daughters of politicians step in as candidates[64]. For example the cousin of Ratu Atut Chosiyah, Governor of Banten Province is Airin Rahmi Diani, Mayor of South Tangerang (Banten province). Ratna Ani Lestari, Banyuwangi Head of District , when elected was the wife of Gde Winasa the Head of District in Jembrana, During the electoral process, Ratna Ani was a MP for Jembrana district. However, Ratna's win was criticized by religious leaders and society groups, who siad that Rana had converted from Islam to Hinduism[65]. During the election period for the head of region in Kediri in 2010, Dr. Haryanti and Hajah Nurlaila, respectively the first and second wife of the incumbent Head of District, Sutrisno, stepped in as candidates[66].

In addition, there is another obstacle in the election system that is disadvantageous to women and even threatens women's success in Parliament. Lena Maryana Mukti from the *Partai Persatuan Pembangunan* (PPP*)*, Rosmailis and Binny Buchorie from Golkar are all concerned with money politics. Firstly, the open election system enables anyone, including those with no ethics and or political knowledge, to enter Parliament as long as the candidate has enough money. An election system that allows candidates to be selected freely is fertile ground for money politics. The relation between political parties or candidates with their constituents is merely transactional, similar to a seller and a buyer. Political parties or candidates distribute money, goods, T-shirts and so on, to their constituents to win votes, they even repair the roads in their constituency.. In this way, celebrities such as comedians, singers, or movie stars are elected to Parliament, instead of women activists from women's organizations who are genuinely concerned for women's rights. Secondly, women candidates from women's organizations lose confidence when competing with celebrities or family members of political dynasties. Moreover, for political parties today, the purpose of recruiting women candidates is simply to meet the 30% quota requirement. Thirdly, the party system also hinders participation and electability of women candidates. Golkar's women's wing, for instance, has not been able to produce gender sensitivity or a feeling of sisterhood among the women.

Remarkably, women politicians are often jealous and develop prejudice against fellow female politicians in the same party. According to Binny Buchorie, this tendency does not reflect a 'female culture', as women cadres in political parties currently are highly promising and very ambitious to secure certain posts within the party structure. This vigor is set off by the nature of political parties, which may not readily allow these potential women cadres to participate. Political parties tend to secure the interests of

63   Ruth Indiah Rahayu, *Penetapan Sistem Kuota,* op.cit
64   Roy Wijaya, *Jadi Tumpuan, Dinasti Politik Semakin Menguat*article published on 19 August 2013 on Portal Media Komhukum, downloaded on 30 July 2013
65   Kang Irwan, *Bersuamikan Bupati Jembrana, Ratna Jagoan dari Banyuwangi*, article by blogger written on 27 August 2008, kangirwan.wordpress. com, downloaded 30 July 2013
66   Herda Prabadipta, *Mengintip Fenomena Politik Dinasti dalam Pemilukada Kediri*, student paper for Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, 2012

male politicians, and prioritize men when seeking to occupy strategic positions before considering their wives, daughters, or female relatives, as there is a lack of trust in new cadres. However, Binny Buchorie's failure in the 2009 election was blamed on tactical faults in the field during campaign period.

Dian Kartika Sari from the Indonesian Women's Coalition observes that the patriarchal tradition is particularly strong at grassroot level. Women tend to depend on their husbands and do not possess the courage to make their own decisions. Voters are also doubtful about electing women rather than men, unless the constituents have physically met the women candidates. Patriarchal tendencies can also be found in political parties, for example the case of a leader of a political party who defended five of his party cadres who raped a woman on the grounds that the intercourse was consensual. Meanwhile, women politicians from religious-affiliated parties may not conduct any campaigns when the sun has set, while male candidates may campaign at any time. It is argued that it is inappropriate for women to be outside (campaigning) in the evening, as they need to be at home, preparing dinner for their families. Permission from the husband serves as another obstacle for woman, citing a rule in Islam that woman may not lead. The patriarchal culture has made women in West Sumatera reluctant to enter the political arena, as in their opinion politics is 'dirty'. Despite having a matrilineal kinship system in West Sumatera (Minangkabau), the women do not object to being led by men as long as they can live harmoniously. Furthermore, political activity consumes much time and energy which may distract women from their responsibilities in the household.

Women's political participation in Cambodia is culturally constrained by gender stereotyping socialized through education and religion constitutions. Aside from the discrepancy of education levels between men and women, women in Cambodia bear a double burden. On the one hand, women need to oversee domestic duties and manage the family's finances, and on the other hand are expected to generate complementary earnings. These duties leave them with little time to develop a career in politics. General poverty in Cambodia also hampers women's participation in the politics, which would require a strong financial basis.

Typically, during the electoral process, leaders of political parties in Cambodia draft a 'closed' candidates list. Party leaders have the exclusive authority to determine a small number of candidates based upon political and economic interests. Among those who are overlooked are women. Aside from being regarded as powerless, women themselves are overshadowed by a feeling of inferiority. Political parties rarely offer financial support to women candidates, and this affects women's electability. Meanwhile, it is very difficult for female politicians to establish a network with fellow women politicians between parties, at different levels. The civil war and political violence that took place over a significant period of time in Cambodia's history is the underlying factor of political trauma and women are yet to be able to overcome their fear (due to the trauma) and enter politics.

A culture of patriarchy can be seen from the opinion of a Cambodian man (that represents the general view of men) that a woman's place is at home, and it is not suitable for a woman to participate in politics. However, according to a female politician in Cambodia, in essence men are jealous of women who are bold enough to enter politics. Such feeling is demonstrated by the attitudes of men in political parties, who show animosity towards the women. Patriarchal groups within parties are also dominating and they effectively build a strong sense of brotherhood, maintaining their bonds by visiting entertainment centers together, enjoying drinks or karaoke. A female candidate shared her experience during her

candidacy as mayor, when she was asked by a man whether he would lose the house he had been living in since the day he was born if the city were led by a woman.

Female politicians in Cambodia are also the target of vulgar gossip. They are heavily scrutinized by a society that seems to be endlessly following their every move. Husbands are often provoked by such public scrutiny to question their wives' activities with other male politicians especially in the evenings. Questions are frequently raised by the public such as, "what is the wife doing with the (male) politician that they stay together until late." Due to such provocation, husbands are overwhelmed by jealousy and end up divorcing their wives (the politician). Another reason commonly cited for women not participating in politics is great responsibilities at home. In some cases, husbands confine their wives to the house to avoid them from having any activities outside the home.

In Timor-Leste, political partes are the key platforms for women's participation in the politics, such as Parliament or other political positions in Government. Results of research conducted by the Women Caucus of Timor-Leste show that women's participation in political parties has increased substantially. The research focused on women participants who were still active in their parties and identified a number of errors when the women enter Parliament or became part of the Government. Some women were able to pass the electoral selection due to money, personal connections, or they had been important contributors to the parties. As a consequence, women politicians in Parliament or the executive body are not gender sensitive and devoid of a sense of responsibility to promote the quota system in order to have better quality of women's representation.

Resistance from male politicians emerges, as women are seen as political opponents. Negative comments are often expressed regarding hefty demands from women, and how fulfilling one demand would only lead to another. Nevertheless, the male leader of the National Congress for Timorese Reconstruction (CNRT) faction supports women's involvement in politics. In his view, women's emancipation in Timor-Leste is called for, as women also took part in the fight for national independence.

 Therefore, it is only fair that Timor-Leste's Constitution ensures gender fairness and an increase of women's representation in Parliament. Today, Timor-Leste's Attorney General and the Chief Justice are women, and 30% of members of the cabinet are also women, where they hold such posts as Minister for Social Affairs, Minister for Private Sector Affairs, Minister for Culture, Minister for Women's Emancipation, and Deputy Minister for Education and Health.

4.4 WOMEN'S STRATEGIES IN POLITICS: BREAKING THE PATRIARCHAL BARRIERS

In her experience as a member of Parliament in Timor Leste, Maria da Costa Exposto describes how women in Parliament experience discriminatory attitudes. Women are regarded as incapable, and are said to have 'too many needs'[67], unable to work independently, and so on. However, the harsh attitudes gradually subside after women show their active participation in all parliamentary activities. Women's active engagement today has brought positive impacts, as women politicians have started to earn credibility, and have even been entrusted as secretaries, commission leaders, and other strategic positions in Parliament. Maria da Costa Exposto is an example of a women's activist who became an MP.of

---

67   Have "too many needs" refers to consumption of goods

Timor-Leste. Prior to her parliamentary activities, she was involved with numerous projects regarding rights equality and gender strengthening. Given her background, she has extensive understanding on women's rights and regulations that protect the rights of women in Timor-Leste. Her role and popularity make her well known among the public, including among important political figures. Maria da Costa Exposto uses this advantage to enhance her bargaining power with national political elites, both in her capacity as a woman and as an advocate of women's rights.

To fight for the recognition of women's contributions in Parliament, Exposto used lobbying and intervention strategies to form a Women's Caucus in Timor-Leste's Parliament. Exposto explains, "We women need to be actively involved and use the power vested in us to influence policies, which are generally dominated by men. We must show that, as women, we are able." Exposto admits that earning recognition from her male colleagues is challenging. Therefore, it is crucial for women to be equipped with knowledge and capacity. She continues, "We as women need to realize that women's rights are stipulated by the law, therefore we need to equip ourselves with as much information as we can to develop a sound capacity." Exposto acknowledges that one of the underlying challenges for women politicians in Timor-Leste is the low capacity to perform political analysis, thus they are unable to debate with male politicians who have more experience.

A friend of Maria Exposto, also an MP and former secretary to the President, explains that one of the strategies for getting women's opinions recognized in the political arena is by having sufficient knowledge in politics. Prior to voicing a topic for discussion in Parliament, it is essential for women politicians to first study the topic comprehensively by reading references, learning strengths and weaknesses, and having extensive discussions with CSO partners. As reiterated by Exposto, "The failure of a woman who proposes a topic but is unable to maintain her stand and argue her proposal will be used as precedent to disregard recommendations from women, despite the urgency of the topic. It will also be used to support the the view that women are unfit for politics."

Exposto further elaborates that to be involved in politics women need to exercise their 'power'. 'Power' here refers to courage, integrity, adherence to principles, and ability to influence. Exposto is never hesitant to lobby or, through her connections to influential politicians, advocate for national level decisions. One of her experiences was related to a 'shoot on sight' policy by the President against the opposition in one of the districts. Exposto used her power as an MP to defy the policy by saying to the President, "The people in the district elected me as a member of Parliament. I came from that district. If you enforce a 'shoot on sight' policy against the opposition, you might as well erase the district from the map of Timor-Leste. We need to find alternative measures, other than eliminating them (the opposition). There has to be a better way than resorting to violence." Exposto said this in front of all the male politicians who were proponents of the 'shoot on sight' law. Apparently her view affected the President's decision and he repealed martial law in the said district. In addition to showcasing such courage, in order to be accepted by male politicians, women politicians have to be clever in using the media, as well as maintaining good relationships with co-workers (especially influential male co-workers), influential political observers, NGOs and the public.

As for the main prerequisites for demonstrating power, Exposto indentifies four factors. First and foremost is to set a political precedent, especially in upholding the principle of 'prioritizing the interests of the country over personal interests'. Second, she sets an example of being an independent woman

politician, even though her husband and son are in the opposition. Third, her involvement in politics began at the grassroots level from the days of struggle for independence, and she continues to keep in touch with these networks until today. Fourth, she never keeps counts of the sacrifices she has made from the struggle for independence to running the government of an independent Timor-Leste, and therefore she is not driven by the desire to get something in return from the state. Finally, she truly instills her name, 'Maria', to emulate the power of the Virgin Mary, and Maria Goretti, the symbol of martyrdom in the women's struggle in Timor-Leste.

In order to create democratic institutions that better represent the interests of the people, the Philippines passed a law mandating the inclusion of national political parties, regional organizations, and sectoral mass-based organizations in the legislature. This law was passed in 1995 and has been effective since the 1998 election. The party-list system is based on the principles of proportional representation. This system reserves 20% of the seats in the Lower House for national political parties, regional organizations and sectoral mass-based organizations. Parties and mass organizations are elected at the national level, to gain congressional seats in proportion to the votes they received during the election. The system is proven to increase people's participation, and people can use it as a means to evaluate candidates during election and after they are elected into Congress. The idea of a party-list system is also useful in breaking the political popularity tradition and urging political dynasties to adopt a pro-women political platform.

The party-list system then creates an opening for women to enter the political arena through Parliament and to fight for women's interests. A number of political parties in the party-list system have consistently won seats in Parliament since 1999, and consistently represent women and their interests in Congress. One of these parties is *Akbayan*, openly declared socialist feminism as one of the basic pillars or their organization. Similarly, *Gabriella*, which has been left wing since 1998, is a women's political party that has retained seats in Congress since 2004. In the 2001 election, the women's party *Abanse Pinay* also won seats in Congress. However, it should be noted that the achievements of these women are not the result of the gender equality law or the 30% women representation quota system.

The success of female legislators in exercising their capacity as leaders cannot be separated from the role of the Capacity Building and Gender Equality Information Center in Parliament. Olivia Sarmento of the Capacity Building and Gender Equality Information Center explained how the central built a network including the Women's Caucus, UN (United Nations) Women, the Unted Nations Development Program (UNDP) and, of course, with all women parliamentarians. In this respect, the information center provides technical facilities for women MPs, including for preparation for discussions on the state budget in order to ensure gender-responsive budgeting and regulations. It also assists women MPs to prepare for overseas working visits, including preparation of presentation materials. In addition, the group also helps women politicians prepare materials for public hearings, etc., and raises funds for capacity building for women parliamentarians and women parliamentary expert staff.

When the time comes for setting the Congressional agenda, the the role of the representatives is great. This is when the male representative who dominate the House vie for their predominantly masculine agendas to maintain power over their political opponents. This is especially true when it comes to winning strategic political decisions, instead of taking radical actions for the betterment of the Congress and measures that represent the interests of women. An example of this was seen during the passing

of the Reproductive Health Bill into national law. During the 14 years of this endeavor, leaders of the Lower House, which is dominated by men, have been under pressure and have been lobbied by those who oppose the Law on Reproductive Health Rights, supported by the Catholic Church hierarchy. One of their attempts to derail the bill drafting was to create a deadlock during the session. There were even legislators in the Assembly who openly opposed the bill and used their position to keep it from entering the plenary session.

Recently, at the 15th hearing of the Bill on Reproductive Health Rights, parliamentary leaders postponed the vote as MPs failed to make compromises. Meanwhile, President Aquino Jr., issued a public statement in support of the reproductive health bill, which only prompted leaders of the House to push him by saying that it would lose the President votes. This situation could be used by the opposition to claim that the leadership of Aquino Jr. is weak. Support for women from both inside and outside Congress could not break the blockade created by the leaders. The final vote was finally made following the President's appeal to the legislative body.

Proponents of the bill spend all of their time lobbying leaders and consolidating votes to pass the bill. Unfortunately, as the issue of reproductive health is a women's interest issue that conflicts with the dominant conservative mindset supported by the people in power and the Church, it is a challenge to push it through. However, the struggle to pass the bill, albeit sofar unsuccessful, has managed to consolidate cross-gender women issues among politicians, political parties and mass organizations. This agenda is supported by a national coalition led by the Akbayan Party.

This reproductive health issue is in contrast with the prosecution of former chief justice and ombudsman, which is a legacy of Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo's administration. The impeachment movement represents a new regime and expedites response from leaders of Parliament. Good governance and anti-corruption are successful agendas supported by the Liberal Party.

To understand how gender equality enters the state political arena, in Malaysia it is interesting to learn more about the federal state of Penang. Compared to other federal states, Penang is special for it is the only state with an institution that supports and implements good governance and gender equality. This independent institution is much needed by NGOs to voice their demands.

One of the contributors to this research in Penang said that at first there was a People's Agreement to support the ruling party in implementing programs for capacity and leadership building among women. However the Convention of Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) was not not ratified in Malaysia until 1995, and the country still has no law on gender equality. This is not due to the lack of attempts to achieve it. In 2006-2007, a women's organization proposed a bill to ensure gender equality, but one of the influential decision makers in Parliament rejected the proposition. Their argument was that men and women cannot be separated, for they are one social unit. So far, there have been no efforts to re-submit the bill. While the rate of violence against women has escalated it is unrecorded as the police regard it as as a personal issue. Such attitudes by the police is common in small islands.

When the Penang Women's Development Cooperation (PWDC) held a leadership training program for women, grassroots women communities suggested that the training be conducted

in collaboration with mosque authorities. However, when the training was about to begin, the mosque authorities requested that the women wash the dishes at home instead of attending the training. Nevertheless, the low participation of women in politics is not fully rooted from the women in grassroots movements, whose options are limited. There are many female NGO activists or other professionals who consider themselves not 'political animals' and refuse to become a candidate. There are a lot of educated women who prefer to live independently and autonomously, while grassroots women are too busy taking care of their children and husbands.

The concept of gender equality is still difficult to comprehend in everyday life in Malaysia. The cost of daycare is very expensive and it prevents women from having a career, Women of childbearing age (30-40 years old) sometimes get caught up in a situation where they have to decide between raising children and having a career outside the home. This situation has not been seen as a women's gender issue that may be resolved through formal political mechanisms, making it difficult to find women who are interested in participating in politics. In reality, there is currently a growing number of women supporting women parliamentarians, but in terms of both numbers and capacity, women MPs are yet to have the power to increase women's representation.

Indonesian women activists use the gender mainstreaming strategy in the parliamentary system and mechanisms to overcome the patriarchal barriers. Prior to this, they have fought to ensure gender equality by including a 30% women quota into the Bill on General Election, the Bill on Political Parties, and the Bill on Structure and Status in Parliament. As a result, the 30% women quota provision has been successfully stipulated in the Election Law, whereas in the Political Parties Law, it only mentions "the need to consider gender fairness." Meanwhile, there are no provisions for for gender equality mentioned in the revised Structure and Status Law No 22/2003. The Structure and Status Law[68] regulates the system,s mechanisms, rules, and parliamentary institutional support. However, when there is no women quota guarantee in it, then there is no guarantee for women politicians to implement gender mainstreaming in Parliament. During the 2004-2009 period, there were only two female politicians who became chairperson of a commission and a floor leader. Other than that, women politicians are assigned to commissions related to social affairs, health, religion and education. Another institutional apparatus, namely the Regional Representative Council (DPD), only acheived 10% female representation in the 2004 election, and 18% in the 2009 election. Founders of the Parliamentary Women's Caucus, established in 2000 by women MPs elected in 1999-2004 period, hoped to make the Women's Caucus a forum for cross-party politicians to promote and achieve equal access and control between men and women in Parliament[69].

A strategy outside Parliament has been to identify 'potential women' from women's and social movements. Between 2004-2009 a list of women was drawn up and published in a book highlighting 'potential female profiles', copies of which were sent to political parties. This strategy was used as political parties lacked women cadres, while the women's organizaations wanted female candidates with sufficient gender sensitivity and with an agenda to fight for women's interests in Parliament to participate and get elected to represent them. The success of method has yet to

---

68   Ani Sutjipto, Sri Budi Eko Wardani, Yolanda Panjaitan, *Pengarus-utamaan Gender di Parlemen: Studi terhadap DPR dan DPD Periode 2004-2009*, (UNDP Indonesia, 2010)
69   Ani Sutjipto, dkk, *Pengarus-utamaan Gender*, ibid

be determined, but it at least shows that there are many women who have the potential and, in fact, have been involved in substantial political activities outside political parties.

Following the 2004 election, through a number of FGDs on women's movements and research institutions, it was concluded that to increase women's representation through the quota system, women have to actively participate in political parties. The concept of a women's quota system was previously already known among women NGOs and activists but it was not recognized by political parties. It was women's venture into political parties that provided a new experience when dealing with the patriarchal structure within the parties. Another issue that women must deal with is the 'double burden' factor. Male politicians have no idea about the 'double burden' faced by women politicians as they as do not have the same household responsilbilities that women are bound by in the private sphere. Women cadres also have to deal with gender-based violence in the party and it is difficult to answer questions relating to violence because they have to follow the party line. Another troubling factor is that women become easy (media) targets when a woman cadre is involved in an intimate relationship with the party leader.

In Cambodia, the guarantee of political equality for women and men is included in the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGS). It is an important policy aimed at increasing political opportunities for women. In addition, the Cambodian Government has specifically set in the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (the CMDGs) targets for increased women's representation by 2015. Although Cambodia is still far from reaching this target, at least the country has provided a normative guarantee.

As a member of the Association of South-East Asian Nations (ASEAN) Cambodia is also committed to the ASEAN Human Rights Declaration (2012), where it is states in the preamble to the Declaration of the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region "to promote and implement the equitable and effective participation of women whenever possible in all fields and various levels of political, economic, social and cultural life of society at the national, regional and international levels."[70] In other words, women activists in Cambodia use a human rights approach to increase women's participation and representation in state politics.

Although the human rights approach came a little late, according to Ros Sopheap, an activist from Gender and Development in Cambodia, (GADC) the situation has improved in the last 20 years. Cambodia ratified the declaration, and called upon the making of the Anti-Trafficking Law in 2008. NGOs have been working with the Government to formulate gender mainstreaming programs at the grassroots level. As a result some women have managed to gain high positions in Government and the problem of discrimination and violence against women has decreased since 2005. NGOs and the Government have conducted technical meetings in the framework of women's empowerment and the eradication of HIV/AIDS.

Prok Vanny, who was a committee member of the CEDAW, regularly met with eight ministers during the preparation of the CEDAW report. Nevertheless, women's participation in politics remains a challenge. One of the obstacles for women entering politics is related to financial issues. Money politics in Cambodia has become a new cause for concern, and women cannot afford to take part in it. Furthermore, culturally,

---

70 *Politics in the Kingdom: Increasing Female Representaton*, Cambodian Centre for Human Rights, March 2013, bekerjasama dengan Kemitraan dan USAID, 10

women are reluctant to get involved in money politics. Men look down or belittle women who run as candidates in elections. According to GADC there are a lot of men who complain that women had deprived them of the chance to win in elections. Elected women candidates are constantly being told to go back to being housewives and being asked if all women became politicians in Parliament, who would take care of the children, their husbands and their homes? Such provocation often undermines women and strengthens solidarity among men

In conclusion, we have seen that an open electoral system has created opportunities for women to participate. However, there are many barriers that hinder the achievement of gender fairness agendas in the elections, particularly in terms of affirmative action in women's quota systems. Despites the legal support of a national law, the quota system does not necessarily eliminate patriarchal barriers and increase the number of women's representation. However, there are some alternative actions that have successfully shattered the fortress of the patriarchal state and increased female representation.

As women candidates participate in elections on a regular basis, it is important to understand their motivations and examine the legislative measures they may seek to empower women. This is important as a guideline of their commitment to politics, as well as their contribution to the empowerment of women. Substantive contributions by women candidates from political family backgrounds is particularly needed to break the general practice of women candidates who simply replace their husbands, fathers and sons who are unable to maintain their position as the law prevents it. There are, however, some female politicans, and even political dynasties that are commited to the empowerment of women. But as history and political lessons have shown, women members of political dynasties may sometimes break their commitment in order to sustain their political power.

Women's movements and civil society movements in general, need to continue their efforts to create more room for women's participation. A new political measure is required that combines the collective power of lobbyists, and encouraging men to understand and accept the female perspective. Until now, women politicians have had to work within a male perspective which is made harder by having to carry on the burden of household tasks which their male counterparts do not have to do, and therefore putting women at a disadvantage.

In order to promote women's rights, civil society movements, especially women's movements, should organize constituencies to generate public demands for women's welfare. In particular, when raising a controversial issue, the only powerful movement is the consolidation of 'popular sentiment' (cases that touch the heart of the public) and this should be used to push legislators.

Chapter V

Valuable Lessons in the Fight Against Patriarchy

5.1 CONCLUSION

Based on the descriptions in the previous chapters, features of patriarchal politics in South-East Asia that occur at the state level (electoral systems, political parties, parliamentary and executive mechanisms) and at social levels (education system and curriculums, religious lessons and institutions, the media) can be broken down into five categories, namely:

(1) Belittling of women reresentatives: Women are seen as easy targets and are often undermined by their male counterparts. Blatant verbal abuse such as name-calling or using detogatory terms to describe women is often a used to discredit them and make them subjects of ridicule or to portray them as being over emotional.

(2) Male perceptions of knowledge and analytical skills: Entering politics (becoming an MP) requires knowledge and analytical skills. What is understood to be knowledge and analysis is generally seen from a male perspective. The source of knowledge is masculine because it ignores intuition and everyday experiences that women possess in abundance. Women are too easily dismissed for not having this male defined knowledge and analytical skills to enhance their career in political institutions

(3) Money politics: Money politics has long hindered women from participating in politics. The widely accepted assumption is that the main breadwinners are men, while women should only make a complementary income or receive money from their husbands, thus the financial demands of money politics during elections become almost impossible for women to meet.

(4) Time constraints: 59%[71] of women's time is taken up by household tasks during the day. This and having to be at home in the evening is used as a pretext for why women may not participate in politics. Furthermore, all political agendas and activities know no time limits and are adjusted to suit men, who are not constrained by household tasks or curfews. This becomes an obstacle for women since in order to be fully active in politics, they have to follow a male time schedule.

(5) Policital dynasties: On one hand political dynasties facilitate womens participation in politics, but on the other hand they serve to substitute or sustain the dynastic power of the fathers, husbands or sons. This rules out the possibility of women not aliged with a dynasty entering politics, because they are not as popular as women from political dynasties.

---

71   Mona Lilja, *Power, Resistance, and Women Politicians in Cambodia*, (Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, 2008)

One significant problem is that women are driven by different factors when gong into politics (the public domain), and they are required to follow a patriarchal political system. In addition to this they are also still expected to be responsible for the household. In this conflicting situation, women identify two strategies to exercise and explore their social and personal capacities (excercise of power), including collective strategies (from the women's suffrage movement to quota systems), and personal strategies (from womanhood to political dynasties).

Below is the table of women's exercise of power strategies

Entity	Internal Power	External Power
Collective (from women's suffrage to women's representation quota)	Equipping oneself with knowledge Being active in socio-political activities (actively engaged in politics) in Parliament, political parties, or women's organizations/NGOs Being patriotic (putting the state's interests before personal)	Making use of political parties' women's wing Making use of national umbrella women's organizations NGOs Making use of the Parliamentary Women's Caucus Making use of the Women's Affairs Institution or Ministry
Personal	National female symbols Popularity	Making use of a political dynasty or family patriarchy (fathers or husbands as political figures) Using money Making use of the media Political networking with grassroot communities Making use of 'cartel' relations

Source: Results from this research

The employment of women's power in South-East Asia has the collective purpose of changing the patriarchal political system in each country, despite slow progress and setbacks throughout the course of history. We have seen how lessons learned from the struggle for independence in Indonesia, Malaysia and the Philippines , are being adopted in today's political climate to fight for the 30% women's quota system as a result of state patriarchal barriers. It has been demonstrated in the study how state patriarchal systems are preserved by reproducing female stereotypes of women who are weak and emotional. Meanwhile, political reform in Cambodia and Timor-Leste's struggle for independence did not take place until the late 20th century, therefore it will take more time to see if women in these two countries can address the patriarchal barriers in their potical systems.

The table below shows the exercise of women's collective power towards making more room for women's participation.

Women's Suffrage Movement	State		
	Closed	Invited	Created
Hidden	-	-	-
Invisible	No state's political will to fulfill the women quota system and Women's suffrage movement is hiding behind the facade of multiethnicity, violence against women or women's rights (Malaysia, 10.4% quota achievement)		Ratification of international conventions that protect women or promote equal rights or women's representation Equal rights and gender equality are recognized by the state and included in the state constitution or law But Women's suffrage movement is hiding behind the human rights movement (Cambodia, 20.3% quota achievement)
Visible		No women's representation quota stipulated in the national law, despite women's political representation being applied at the local level but Political parties fight for reproductive rights law in Parliament and Women's suffrage movement to articulate women's interests and identity openly (the Phillippines, 22.9% quota achievement)	The 30% women quota provision is listed in constitution or national law Ratification of international conventions that protect women or promote equal rights or women's representation and Women's suffrage movement to articulate women's interests and identity openly and Political parties implement the quota system internally (Timor-Leste, 32.3% quota achievement) (Indonesia, 18.2% quota achievement, with a note that the political parties are yet to have a quota system policy)

Source: Results from this research

What is unique in the table above is the position of **the Philippines**. Despite not having the 30% women's quota system in its national law, the Women's Suffrage movement and political parties have been visible in making a more proportionate electoral system through the party-list system, so that

women candidates have a greater chance of getting elected. Furthermore, women's interests agendas, such as the reproductive health bill drafting, are openly discussed in Parliament. **Malaysia** also has no quota law, but the movements are able to utilize the diverse and open federal state to include women's interests (invited). Women's political participation may also arise from opposition parties (invisible). The movements in **Cambodia** have managed to include gender fairness in the Constitution of the Kingdom (created), although it hasn't specifically provided the quota system policy. The struggle to fulfill women's interests is realized through civil rights movements and grassroots economic empowerment (invisible). In **Indonesia**, the Women's Suffrage movement and the affirmative action quota system have been visible with a guarantee in the Election Law (created), but it has not been a fundamental policy for political parties. Consequently, Indonesia scores a lower women's representation than the Philippines. Similar to Indonesia, the room for women's participation in **Timor-Leste** is visible, and the state ensures the legality of the quota system (created). Timor Leste is a newly independent country that ensures equal opportunities for all its people.

The table below demonstrates the excercise of women's personal power, which links to state political institutions.

Personal Power	Legislative and Executive		
	Closed	**Invited**	**Created**
Hidden		Able to join the electoral process through political parties but relies only on knowledge and gender sensitivity therefore not elected	
Invisible		Able to join electoral process through CSOs under political parties without gender sensitivity electability is 50%	Using money politics in political parties supported by celebrity status will be elected
Visible			Using a political dynasty or patriarchal figures (fathers, husbands) And female symbols of motherhood will be elected Or Former activists during the nation's struggle for independence will be elected

Source: Results from this research

By looking at the table, we can identify two polar extremes. On the one hand, there is the reality that women's visible and created power in the state's political sphere comes from women in political dynasties, who are subordinated behind the family's patriarchal figures and use culturally-recognized female symbols. This phenomenon appears to be a striking reality in politics in South-East Asia. On the other hand, women who are aware of gender issues and come from the suffrage movement are able to follow the electoral process but do not have visible capacity

and power. This will not happen until there is a momentum that makes their capacity visible, such as independence or political reform.

So what can be highlighted from the experiences of women, both collectively and personally, when breaking through and fighting against state patriarchal barriers?

First, women's quota regulations or provisions for gender equality in the constitution and national laws are a significant legal guarantee. However it does not necessarily correlate with more visible room for women's participation. The role of women's interest groups, both inside and outside Parliament, is significant in creating visible room for women's participation and 'created' laws for women. There is also a sense of complexity that women who win elections (legislative/executive) are subordinates of a family patriarch and that they use women symbols.

Second, women politicians are forced to adapt to and follow the political conditions of the patriarchal state, which does not accommodate for women's 'double burden' (public and private obligations). Most women politicians take on an additional role, that of the politican, and fight to gain equal recognition as male politicians. However unlike their male counterparts, women representatives are also required to continue their duties in the household, therefore creating a double burden.

Third, there is a need for cooperation between women's interest groups, both in and outside Parliament, and political parties, women politicians and religious institutions, to realize political gender-equiality reform. A gender-hub is required as a means of liaising among stakeholders. The cooperation should not be only implemented nationally, but also at the regional South-East Asia level, particularly when considering the fact that we are all bound by the ASEAN Human Rights Declaration, which explicitly specifies a provision for increased participation of women at political, economic, social and cultural levels.

Fourth, a less legally based performance indicator is required to assess whether women's political participation has been substantially implemented and state policies are committed to fulfill women's interests. Women's interests should be interpreted as something more than just a prerequisite to fulfilling the quota system in Parliament, but should be understood in terms of political, economic, social and reproductive issues (such as reproductive rights, reproductive health, protection against violence and trafficking of women, and so forth).

5.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Make interventions to educational curriculums that perpetuate patriarchy and reproduce gender stereotypes. These interventions should be aimed at creating an egalitarian concept of gender relations in the school curriculum.

2. Review the patriarchal concept of the family perpetuated by religious leaders, by encouraging them to create new gender-equal interpretations.

3. Replace the female symbols of motherhood by deconstructing the stereotype that women are weak, irrational, unable to control their desires and must be subordinate to men. We need a female symbol of citizenship (instead of motherhood or fatherhood) which maintains the sustainability of gender-balanced political reform.

4. Propose the agendas of the women's suffrage movement to political parties and build solid cooperation to implement the women's quota system, both domestically and among all South-East Asian countries. This cooperation includes encouraging political reform to create an egalitarian political climate that blends femininity and masculinity, as well as encouraging the creation of regulations on the women's quota system.

Sources of Reference

BOOKS

Bhasin, Kamla, *What is Patriarchy*, (New Delhi: Kali for Women, 1993), 3

Blackburn, Susan, *Women and the State in Modern Indonesia*, (Cambridge University Press, 2004), Introduction

de Stuers, Cora Vreeda, *Gerakan Perempuan Indonesia: Kemajuan dan Pencapaian*, edisi terjemahan, (Jakarta: Komunitas Bambu, 2008)

Collins, John M., *Reconstructing Acces in the Cambodian Education Systemn*, dalam Domald B Holsinger, W. James Jacob, *Inequality in Education: Comparative and International Perspecetives*, (Hongkong: Comparative Education Research Centre-University of Hongkong, 2008), 108

Djajadiningrat-Nieuwenhuis, Medelon, *Ibuisme and Priyayization: Path or Power?* in Elsbeth Locher-Scholten and Anke Niehof (eds), *Indonesian Women in Focus: Past and Present Notions*, (Faris, 1987), 101

Eviota, Elizabeth Uy, *The Political Economy of Gender: Women and the Sexual Division of Labour in the Philippines,* (London & New Jersey: Zed Books Ltd, 1992), 34

Frisk, Sylvia, *Submitting to God: Women and Islam in Urban Malaysia*, (Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asia Studies, 2009), 27-62

Gaventa, John, *Finding the Spaces for Change: A Power Analysis*, (Institute of Development Studies: IDS Bulletin, Volume 37, Number 6, November 2006), 24-29

Lilja, Mona, *Power, Resistance, and Women Politicians in Cambodia*, (Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, 2008),

Mohamed, Maznah dan Cecilia Ng, tan beng hui, *Feminism and the Women's Movement in Malaysia: An Unsung (R) evolution*, (Oxon & New York: Routledge, 2006)

Ng, Ceclia, & Maznah Mohamed, *Primary but Subordinated: Changing Class and Gender Relations in Rural Malaysia*, in *Structures of Patriarchy, the State, The Community and the Household in Modernising Asia*, ed. Bina Argawal, (London: Zed Books, 1988), 52

Perez, Linda P, *The Filipino Woman's Role* in *The Humanization of Social Life*, ed. Christopher J. Wheatley, (Washington: The Council for Research in Values and Philosophy, 2004)

Ruth Indiah Rahayu, *Militerisme dan Ideologi Koncowingking: Pengukuhan Ideologi Perempuan Indonesia Secara Pemaknaan Ksatria* Jawa, dalam *(*2005), in *Warisan Otoritarianisme Orde Baru*, ed. F.X. Baskara Tulus Wardaya, (*Jakarta: ELSAM and PUSDEP, 2007), 24

Smith-Heffner, Nancy D. *Khmer American: Identity and Moral Education in a Disporic Community*, (California: University of California Press, 1999),

Sutjipto, Ani, Sri Budi Eko Wardani, Yolanda Panjaitan, *Pengarus-utamaan Gender di Parlemen: Studi terhadap DPR dan DPD Periode 2004-2009*, (UNDP Indonesia, 2010)

Stoller, Ann Laura, *Capitalism and Confrontation in Sumatra's Plantation Belt 1870-1979*, (University Michigan Press, 1995), *Introduction*

Taylor, John G, *Perang Tersembunyi: Sejarah Timor Timur yang Dilupakan*, translated edition, (Jakarta: FORTILOS, 1998), 21-23

Tanggok, M. Iksan, *Orang China Menyebarkan Islam Sampai Indonesia*, dalam *Menghidupkan Kembali Jalur Sutra*, (Jakarta: Gramedia, Pustaka Utama, 2010)

Walby, Sylivia, *Theorizing Patriarchy*, (Cambridge: Basil Blackwell, 1990), 92

PAPERS & ARTICLES

Bari, Farzana,*Women's Political Participation: Issues and Challenges*, a paper (Bangkok: *Division for the Advancement of Women*-UN, 2005)

Bulding Sustainable Patnerships to Promote Women's Political Representation in the Southeast Asian Region, a baseline assesment report by IKAT US Component 1- Power, (Jakarta: Kemitraan, 2012)

Pascaud-Becane, Geneuve, *Participation of Women in Political Life*, (Geneve: Seri Report and Documents N 35, Inter-Parliamentary, 1999)

Politics in the Kingdom: Increasing Female Representaton, Cambodian Centre for Human Rights, March 2013, a cooperation between Kemitraan dan USAID, 10

Prabadipta, Herda, *Mengintip Fenomena Politik Dinasti dalam Pemilukada Kediri*, student paper for Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang, 2012

Ruth Indiah Rahayu, *Penetapan Sistem Kuota 30% Perempuan di Indonesia: Tinjauan Sejarah*, sebuah makalah penelitian yang merupakan kerjasama dengan Kalyanamitra, Jakarta, 2008

Sethi, Gabriella, *Increasing Women's Political Representation and Participation in Cambodia through the Implementation of Gender Quota*, executive summary (CCHR, 2013)

Sobritchea, Carol, *The Impact of* American Colonial Education *on Filipino Women* in Asian Studies, volume 1-2 (1990)

INTERNET

Bathia, Kabir, *Nur Kasih* (*Light of Love*), 2009, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nur_Kasih

Empower Malaysia, http://empowermalaysia.org/blog/2013/04/16/mamabersihs-manifesto/ downloaded on 2 October 2013

Castro, Lina V. *Philippines Statistical Development: Program, 2011-2017: Local Statistics Development*, www.pep-net.org/.../Day3_NSCB_Castro.pdf downloaded on 28 Mei 2013

Irwan, Kang, *Bersuamikan Bupati Jembrana, Ratna Jagoan dari Banyuwangi*, a blog dated 27 Agustus 2008, kangirwan.wordpress.com, downloaded on 30 Juli 2013

Gender Media Monitoring Project, http://www.allvoices.com/contributed-news/12289733-gender-education-to-gender-sensitive-communication downloaded on 30 Juli 2013

Nano, Noberto Batch, *Gender Education to Gender Sensitive Communication*,

Ospina, Sofi, dan Isabel de Lima, *Participation Women in Politics and Decision Making in Timor-Leste: A Recent History*, Unifem-Timor-Leste Program Office, 14-15, http://www.cdi.anu.edu.au/x_GEN_D_P/2006_TL_Ospina.UNIFEM.REP.pdf

Shah, Angilee. *Women's Political Role on Rise in Philippines*, 14 Oktober 2005, http://www.international.ucla.edu/article.asp?parentid=31539 downloaded on 26 Mei 2013

Silvestre, http://www-mcnair.berkeley.edu//2001journal//Jsilvestre.html

Sarayeth, Tife, *Media Reform Experiences in Cambodia*, sebuah paper yang dipresentasikan dalam simposium *Beyond Media* Education di Manila, 20-25 September 2010, waccglobal.org/.../658-**Media**-reform-experiences, downloaded on 2 October 2013

Wulandari, Lia, *Pemilu Serentak Bisa Basmi Politik Dinasti*, http://www.merdeka.com/politik/perludem-pemilu-serentak-bisa-basmi-politik-dinasti.html, downloaded on 30 July 2013

Wijaya, Roy, *Jadi Tumpuan, Dinasti Politik Semakin Menguat*, published on 19 Augusts 2013 on Portal Media Komhukum downloaded on 30 July 2013